

Mandated workshop on activity 9 of the workplan of the response measures forum

Identifying and assessing the impacts of the implementation of response measures taking into account intergenerational equity, gender considerations and the needs of local communities, indigenous peoples, youth and other people in vulnerable situations

Informal note by the Chair of the Subsidiary Body for the Technical Advice for Scientific and the Chair of the Subsidiary Body for Implementation

I. Introduction

A. Background and mandate

1. The COP, CMP and CMA agreed on the workplan of the forum on impacts of the implementation of response measure (RM forum) and its Katowice Committee on the Impacts of the Implementation of Response Measures (KCI).¹

2. Pursuant to annex II to decisions 4/CP.25, 4/CMP.15 and 4/CMA.2, the forum on the impacts of the implementation of response measures was mandated to convene an in-session workshop on workplan activity 9 “identifying and assessing the impacts of the implementation of response measures taking into account intergenerational equity, gender considerations and the needs of local communities, indigenous peoples, youth and other people in vulnerable situations” at SB 56 in Bonn.

B. Informal note

3. The SBSTA Chair and the SBI Chair, with the assistance of the secretariat, have issued this informal note under their own authority. This note is informal in nature, has no status, and does not represent agreed views, ideas or text; nor is it an attempt to draw any conclusions on possible areas of convergence or divergence. It does not attempt to provide a record of all views expressed during the in-session workshop or to indicate the weight of support that each of the options appeared to have.

4. This note does not attempt to synthesize the information presented by speakers. However, the views expressed by speakers and participants during the workshop are reflected in the note.

II. Proceedings

5. The workshop was held on 7 June 2022 (16:00 to 19:00) in Bonn, under the guidance of the SB Chairs and convened Parties, observers, experts and other stakeholders of interest.

6. The workshop focused on workplan activity 9, i.e. identify and assess the impacts of the implementation of response measures taking into account intergenerational equity, gender considerations and the needs of local communities, indigenous peoples, youth and other people in vulnerable situations.

7. The workshop aims at providing a space for Parties and stakeholders to reflect views, share experiences and best practices with a view to advancing the implementation of the workplan activity.

8. Mr. Tosi Mpanu Mpanu delivered the opening remarks in his capacity as Chair of the SBSTA and on behalf of Marianne Karlsen, Chair of the SBI. He invited Andrei Marcu from Papua New Guinea to facilitate the workshop.

9. Following persons/organizations delivered presentations which are made available on the UNFCCC event webpage:²

(a) KCI members: Annela Anger-Kraavi;

(b) Parties: Antigua and Barbuda, Ghana and the USA;

(c) Experts: Cathy Li from Global Center on Adaptation, Gertrude Kenyangi from Support for Women in Agriculture and Environment, Susanna Israelsson from Saami Council and Bert Del Wel from International Trade Union Confederation.

¹ Decision 4/CP.25, 4/CMP.15 and 4/CMA.2

² https://unfccc.int/event/forum_WPactivity_9

III. Summary of presentations and discussions

10. This chapter provides summaries of the presentations and the ensuing discussions resulting from an exchange of views among the workshop participants.

A. Technical work by the KCI on activity 9

Summary of the presentation

11. A KCI member introduced the technical paper³ prepared by the KCI in implementation of this activity and the recommendations made by the KCI to the forum.

12. The KCI member noted that the technical paper was still a work in progress and it was prepared in accordance with the workplan of the response measures forum and its KCI, as well as the implementation strategies and the agreed outlines set out in Annex VI of the fifth meeting of the KCI.

13. The member further noted that for purposes of this technical paper, vulnerable peoples denotes the collective of the groups on whom the impact of response measures is examined in the paper, namely: women, local communities, indigenous peoples, disabled people, youth, the elderly, and other people in vulnerable situations.

14. The approach applied by the technical paper included the following aspects:

(a) Identifying impacts of response measures through examining existing generic and case-specific qualitative and quantitative literature on effects of various selected policies consistent with 2°C pathways and 1.5°C pathways based on existing literature that is publicly available;

(b) Identifying methodologies used in existing research to assess the impacts of response measures, where relevant;

(c) Reviewing inputs from the stakeholders and experts (including relevant UNFCCC constituencies and Constituted Bodies) to identify description of policies or measure consistent with 2°C pathways and 1.5°C pathways and to identify socioeconomic impacts of implementing strategies on different countries or groups identified through different forms of engagement;

(d) Inferring, where relevant and appropriate, effects and impacts on vulnerable people from effects on larger (sub)sets of the population that include them.

15. In assessing the literature on the impacts of response measures on people in vulnerable situations, this paper selects the following response measures as key policies consistent with the 2°C and 1.5°C pathways:

(a) General emission reduction policies, such as carbon trading and energy efficiency;

(b) Phasing down of coal and the removal of inefficient fossil fuel subsidies;

(c) The adoption of renewable energy; and

(d) Increasing forestry.

16. The technical paper described each of the above policies and summarized their impacts on people in vulnerable situations. The impacts on each identified category of people in vulnerable situations were summarized in a table (Table. 1) in the draft technical paper.

17. The key takeaways from the technical paper were underlined as follows:

(a) The literature reveals that vulnerable peoples are consistently marginalised from the process of planning and implementing response measures;

³ Available at https://unfccc.int/sites/default/files/resource/KCI6_7_TP%20Draft%20%20technical%20paper%20on%20vulnerable%20groups_0.pdf

(b) While studies on the impacts of mitigation measures are rising rapidly, there is relatively limited research on assessing and quantifying the social and economic impacts of response measures on the vulnerable peoples and existing studies focus more on the policy making process than assessing impacts;

(c) There is evident variation and unequal coverage across the different groups within vulnerable peoples, with more studies examining impacts on women and the poor;

(d) Negative impacts of response measures on vulnerable peoples can exacerbate their vulnerability, and alleviating them requires the implementation of specific targeted measures commensurate with the specific impacts; and

(e) Engaging vulnerable peoples in the process of designing and implementing response measures is essential for

(i) increasing mitigation policies' success and their effectiveness;

(ii) harnessing indigenous knowledge;

(iii) increasing awareness and technology transfers; and

(iv) implementing policies to reduce vulnerable peoples' vulnerabilities.

18. With regards to the possible next steps, the KCI member noted that there was an urgent need for further research for measuring the impacts of response measures on vulnerable peoples, incorporate the ensuing research results in the design of response measures, and design policies that reduce the negative impacts of response measures on vulnerable peoples.

19. In addition, it was found that data on vulnerable people was not always available in economic and labour force data and further research needs to include (a) qualitative analysis and (b) primary research based on direct input and engagement from the vulnerable groups on their experiences and knowledge.

20. Furthermore, meaningful engagement with vulnerable people should also involve discussions with and representation from the vulnerable peoples in policy discussions to identify impacts on response measures on them and ways of reducing negative impacts, and to incorporate their input in the design and implementation of in-jurisdiction and global mitigation policies.

Summary of discussion

21. One Party was of the view that in addition to vulnerable groups covered in the technical paper, the other people in vulnerable situations could have included those in energy poverty, refugees, those in war-torn situations and those who survived from the tsunami. The Party expressed willingness to see in the next iteration of the technical paper a new section covering these peoples in vulnerable situations. On the way forward, the Party underlined the need to develop country or region-specific case studies with concrete examples on how to identify vulnerable groups mostly affected by the implementation of the response measures and how to establish social networks to minimize the impacts on these people.

22. Another Party noted that the technical paper in its next iteration should aim at having a broader understanding of the provisions under activity 9. The Party reiterated that people in vulnerable situations under activity 9 were considered in the context of identification and assessment of the impacts of the implementation of response measures.

23. One Party drew attention of the vulnerable situation confronted by small island developing countries (SIDS), which were at the forefront of the climate change impacts. The Party underlined the importance of more capacity building for SIDS for them to have a better understanding of how the impacts are applied in SIDS and what specific issues are relevant in the context of SIDS.

24. One Party highlighted the need for the following support to

(a) conduct studies what would aid the Parties to identify and assess the impacts on the level of implementation of response measures taking into account inter-generational equity;

(b) provide technical consultations with stakeholders at the local, national and regional levels to collect inputs and to define concrete measures aimed at eliminating gender inequalities;

(c) continue monitoring and reporting the impacts of response measures, considering gender, indigenous people and vulnerable communities;

(d) mainstream gender into national climate change policies and action plans;

(e) strengthen the role of civil society organizations in voicing out the impacts of response measures to the vulnerable groups; and

(f) support platforms spearheaded by civil society organizations in the reporting on the impacts of response measures.

25. In light of her country's reliance on fossil fuels for base load electricity, one Party requested that energy security be adequately addressed in the technical paper. The Party also requested that some assessment on the impacts of voluntary carbon mechanism in the forestry sector be included as a complement to the work done on REDD plus.

B. Inputs from experts, practitioners, and relevant organizations on activity 9

1. Presentation by the representative of youth and children

26. The intervention noted that it was the children and young people of today who would face the worst effects of climate change and the collective action, including youth involvement, was crucial to drive public policy on mitigation.

27. The intervention highlighted the importance of engaging youth, especially youth from the global south, in the UNFCCC process, including the response measures forum and its KCI and exploring the possibility of facilitating exchange of views with other constituted bodies to share lessons learned.

2. Presentation by the representative of women and gender

28. The presentation highlighted that the workplan of the forum and its KCI was rich in arming people with skills to do analyses and assessments on the impacts of the response measures, but it lacked a clear link to real and tangible support such as funds, technology and expertise that would build women's capacity, and through them that of their children and their communities.

29. In terms of how to minimize the negative impacts, the incentive structure should be changed in such a way that the process is gender responsive, participatory, transparent, inclusive and is accompanied by an equitable share of benefits.

30. Respect for traditional and indigenous knowledge, as well as the rights of women members of indigenous and local communities to access genetic resources and cultural sites in terrestrial ecosystems gazette, were highlighted as inter-connected issues.

3. Presentation by the representative of indigenous people

31. The representative lamented that the indigenous people faced unprecedented impacts from climate change and, meanwhile, were coping with continued loss of land due to resource extraction (e.g. forestry and mining) and, lately, the developments in low-carbon transition. For example, windfarms were planned in reindeer herding districts, the plantation of monoculture tree were devastating for biodiversity and the reindeer husbandry, and minerals for electric vehicles were mined on indigenous land.

32. The representative further highlighted the social and health impacts of losing land, ranging from increased local conflicts, racism and criminals to concerns on the mental health and cultural stress. In light of these negative impacts, the representative stressed the importance of engaging indigenous people in relevant research and decision-making processes, which was key for the successful implementation of climate actions.

4. Presentation by the representative of trade unions

33. The representative was of the opinion that the negative impacts of response measures were rooted in the unfair economic model that led to poverty, corruption and inequalities. In this regard, trade unions called for creating a new social contract based on job creation, green jobs, social protection and against inequality and discrimination. The representative further highlighted that the cost of inaction was much higher and that it was therefore more important to take actions to address the negative impacts than to continue discussing possible courses of action.

34. Workers without formal contracts, as well as those in agriculture, forestry and fossil fuel industries, were expected to be more vulnerable to the effects of response measures and thus needed adequate social protection.

35. Green job analyses were conducted in Senegal, Nigeria, and Ghana by the governments and trade unions in collaboration with the ILO. The presentation stressed the importance of translating the key messages from these analyses into climate action plans, particularly the NDCs, in view of creating an enabling environment for countries to raise ambitions.

C. Experience and best practice shared by Parties

1. Presentation by Antigua and Barbuda

36. The presentation highlighted the policies and measures taken to mainstream women and gender in the country's climate actions and the NDC. The SIRF Fund was established to allow vulnerable communities, including women, to access financing for adaptation. Specific social and gender targets and indicators were included in the updated NDC of Antigua and Barbuda.

37. With regards to the impacts on vulnerable groups, the presentation highlighted that the updated NDC provided increased opportunities for ensuring gender equality and women's empowerment. It further noted that some job groups would be negatively impacted as skills transfer was less adaptable, with mechanics for fossil fuel vehicles and service attendants at gas stations being two of the most notable groups (the latter group was dominated by women).

2. Presentation by Ghana

38. The presentation introduced a case study jointly undertaken by the Environmental Protection Agency of Ghana and ERCST which assessed the cross-border impacts of the implementation of response measures on Ghana using both qualitative and modelling tools. Overall, the case study came to the conclusion that international actions could have social and economic effects on Ghana in the coming years.

39. In terms of gender consideration, it was found that women were less represented in various sectors. In this regard, the presenter underscored the importance of considering the gender gap in the policy-forming process in Ghana.

40. The presentation concluded that there was limited research on assessing and quantifying the impacts of response measures, especially for the impacts on vulnerable people. Furthermore, the literature supporting the identification of these impacts was split into silos (i.e., they tended to focus on issues related to one group, such as gender, youth, indigenous peoples etc). In this regard, a taxonomy of the impacts of intersectional inequalities would facilitate this kind of assessment. The presentation further noted that the case study could be enhanced by conducting a more detailed study focusing on vulnerable groups, mainly using a qualitative approach.

3. Presentation by the USA

41. The presentation introduced various frameworks in the US for integrating gender considerations in the climate policies and actions on mitigation and adaptation.

42. In terms of gender analysis, the presentation shared a methodology that provided guidance for potential gender issues and recommended gender-responsive actions during project development and implementation for domestic policy making and international climate programming in the US. The methodology includes following steps:

(a) Community consultation and review of existing research to understand gender in the context of the community;

(b) Discussing the context information with local partners, communities and other colleagues to analyse how it can or should impact the program's design and results;

(c) Incorporating the findings of the gender analysis into the proposal design and clearly addressing identified risks.

43. In addition to the gender analysis, gender-related qualitative and quantitative indicators were also deployed to follow up the impact of the methodology on the ground.

D. Summary of discussions

25. Participants expressed their appreciation for the KCI's work on the workplan activity 9 and sent gratitude to all presenters on their presentations.

26. One Party inquired how to use indigenous knowledge to maximize the impacts of response measures and the importance of social dialogue in designing climate policies. In response, the representative of indigenous peoples noted that indigenous knowledge was characterized by lived experiences and values and how indigenous people understood and interacted with nature. In this regard, the representative further emphasized the importance of having indigenous people participating in designing, formulating and implementing climate change policies in view of maximizing the impacts of response measures. The representative of trade unions noted that social dialogue went into the heart of the work of trade unions and it was an important element in developing climate policies that would be beneficial for the whole society. The representative further noted that social dialogue brought workers, employers and other stakeholders to the same table in the process of policy formulation and implementation, which helped to minimize the social impacts (e.g. unemployment) of unprecedented events, such as the COVID-19 pandemic.

27. One Party asked whether the 80 response measures identified in the empirical study in Ghana were independent or inclusive and whether the net effect of response measures had been figured in the study. In response to the first question, the representative of ERCST explained that the response measures identified in the study were not singular ones but were grouped into 15 and summed up sector by sector. The representative noted that the second question is an important point to be included in the analysis as a negative effect.

28. One Party noted that some presentations at the workshop reiterated the comments made by the KCI at its 6th meeting, which requested the technical paper consider the impacts of response measures on people living in energy poverty. The Party also reiterated the importance of considering the impacts of mitigation policies on people in vulnerable situations in the process of policy implementation and echoed the urgent need for more research and studies on the impacts of response measures on different vulnerable groups.

29. One Party pointed out that the workshop offered Parties an opportunity to learn from relevant experiences of other countries. In this regard, the Party proposed that future workshops on activity 9 could examine the impacts on people in vulnerable situations by focusing on specific carbon-intensive sectors (such as manufacturing, iron and ore). Another Party echoed that some sectors would be impacted by the implementation of response measures (such as border carbon adjustment), including cross-border impacts, and therefore people working on these impacted sectors should be considered as one of the vulnerable groups to the implementation of response measures.

30. One Party underlined the importance of identifying sector-specific methodologies and tools that could be used by Parties to analyse and assess the impacts of response measures on people in vulnerable situations in order to better inform climate actions. In the same vein, some Parties highlighted the need to customize methodologies and tools taking into account

specific national and regional circumstances and the need to carry out country-specific case studies on the assessment and analysis of the impacts of response measures using such methodologies and tools.

31. One Party found the case study carried out by ERCST on Ghana very helpful and emphasized the urgent need to have more case studies conducted in other countries. The Party proposed that a similar case study could be carried out on the socio-economic impacts of mitigation actions undertaken by ICAO on her own country which heavily relied on aircraft to transport goods and services. The Party elaborated that the case study could focus on technological and operational aspects of the response measures implemented by ICAO, and the results from which would better inform the country's transition including its aircraft fleet.

32. One Party echoed previous interventions made by some Parties on the urgent need to carry out country-specific case studies with concrete examples. The Party was of the view that the studies should have in-depth research on policy issues that came into play with response measures (such as trade impacts) and seek collaboration among Parties to address challenges arising from the impacts. The Party further pointed out that the capacity building on using tools and methodologies to assess the impacts of response measures should not be limited to producing knowledge products by the KCI. A system should be put in place by the KCI to build in-country capacity. In this regard, resources should be allocated to countries and people in vulnerable situations, which mostly need support for the transition to a low-carbon economy. With regards to the technical paper drafted by the KCI on activity 9, the Party stressed that the research should go beyond literature review and more in-depth research would be needed on issues related to people in vulnerable groups. The Party also proposed to collaborate with the UNFCCC local communities and indigenous peoples platform in the view of developing tools that could be used to address the impacts of response measures on indigenous peoples.

E. Closing remarks

At the end of the discussion, the facilitator took note of the presentations and rich discussion contributed by both Parties and observers. He noted that the issues discussed at the workshop on people in vulnerable situations are an integral part of the work programme of the response measures forum and emphasized the importance of ensuring that these issues were not only brought up for discussion in the workshop but also internalized in policy decisions and those affected participated in the policy-making process.
