



---

**COMPLIANCE COMMITTEE  
OF THE KYOTO PROTOCOL**

**CC/EB/39/2024/2  
16 December 2024**

***ENFORCEMENT BRANCH***

**Thirty-ninth meeting**

2 July 2024, 13:00 – 18:00 CEST

Hybrid Meeting

Bonn, Germany

**Report on the meeting**

**1. Opening of the meeting**

1. The secretariat welcomed participants and reported that the enforcement branch, with its decision on 15 May 2024 (see document CC/EB/2024/1, attached as annex I to this report), elected Mr. Arne Riedel as chairperson and Ms. Paulette Bynoe as vice-chairperson using electronic means.
2. The enforcement branch expressed its gratitude to Ms. Paulette Bynoe and Ms. Karoliina Anttonen for serving as chairperson and vice-chairperson, respectively and welcomed the newly elected chairperson and vice-chairperson.
3. The chairperson of the enforcement branch, Mr. Arne Riedel, opened the thirty-ninth meeting of the enforcement branch and welcomed the members and alternate members of the branch to the meeting. The list of members and alternate members present at the meeting is contained in annex II to this report.
4. At the request of the chairperson, the secretariat ascertained the existence of quorum, and provided information on the administrative, logistical and housekeeping arrangements. The secretariat also informed the meeting that a live broadcast link to the meeting had been posted on the UNFCCC website, where a recording of the meeting would also be available.

**2. Round of introduction of members and alternate members of the enforcement branch**

5. The members and alternate members of the enforcement branch introduced themselves and detailed their experience and professional backgrounds.

**3. Adoption of the agenda and organization of work**

6. The enforcement branch adopted the provisional agenda without changes ([CC/EB/39/2024/1](#)) and agreed to conduct its work as presented by the chairperson in the indicative schedule of the meeting.
7. As per rule 9 of the rules of procedure of the Compliance Committee of the Kyoto Protocol (hereinafter, the “rules of procedure”),<sup>1</sup> the branch conducted its business in open session and agreed

---

<sup>1</sup> Decision [4/CMP.2](#) as amended by decisions [4/CMP.4](#), [8/CMP.9](#) and [6/CMP.17](#).



## COMPLIANCE COMMITTEE OF THE KYOTO PROTOCOL

CC/EB/39/2024/2  
16 December 2024

to address agenda item 4 (Question of implementation with respect to Liechtenstein) in closed session. A representative of Liechtenstein joined the meeting virtually for agenda item 4.

### 4. Question of implementation with respect to Liechtenstein

8. In accordance with section VI, paragraph 1, of the procedures and mechanisms relating to compliance under the Kyoto Protocol (hereinafter, the “procedures and mechanisms”),<sup>2</sup> the Compliance Committee received a question of implementation raised by the expert review team (ERT) in the report on the review of the report upon expiration of the additional period for fulfilling commitments for the second commitment period of the Kyoto Protocol of Liechtenstein submitted in 2023.<sup>3</sup>

9. Pursuant to section VII, paragraph 1, of the procedures and mechanisms and rule 19, paragraph 1, of the rules of procedure, the bureau of the Compliance Committee allocated the question of implementation with regard to Liechtenstein to the enforcement branch on 24 May 2024 for its consideration in accordance with section V, paragraphs 4–6, of the procedures and mechanisms.

10. On 27 May 2024, the secretariat notified the members and alternate members of the enforcement branch of the question of implementation, in accordance with rule 19, paragraph 2, of the rules of procedure, and of its allocation to the branch.

11. The question of implementation relates to compliance with Article 3, paragraph 1 bis, of the Doha Amendment to the Kyoto Protocol (annex I to decision 1/CMP.8).<sup>4</sup>

12. On the basis of the assessment of the information submitted by Liechtenstein in its report upon expiration of the additional period for fulfilling commitments for the second commitment period of the Kyoto Protocol submitted on 24 October 2023,<sup>5</sup> and paragraph 91 of the annex to decision 22/CMP.1 entitled “Guidelines for review under Article 8 of the Kyoto Protocol”, the ERT concluded that the aggregate anthropogenic greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions of Liechtenstein in the second commitment period exceed the quantity of emission reduction units (ERUs), certified emission reductions (CERs), temporary certified emission reductions (tCERs), long-term certified emission reductions (lCERs), assigned amount units (AAUs) and removal units (RMUs) in the retirement account of Liechtenstein for the same period.<sup>6</sup>

13. The ERT identified this problem as a question of implementation in accordance with decision 22/CMP.1 in conjunction with decision 4/CMP.11.<sup>7</sup>

14. In accordance with section VII, paragraphs 2–3, of the procedures and mechanisms and rule 11, paragraph 2, of the rules of procedure, on 19 June 2024 the branch adopted by electronic means

---

<sup>2</sup> Decision 27/CMP.1, annex.

<sup>3</sup> [FCCC/KP/CMP/2023/TPR/LIE](https://unfccc.int/sites/default/files/resource/20231024_True-up%202023%20period%20report_Liechtenstein.pdf).

<sup>4</sup> [FCCC/KP/CMP/2023/TPR/LIE](https://unfccc.int/sites/default/files/resource/20231024_True-up%2023%20period%20report_Liechtenstein.pdf), paras. 8–9 and table 2.

<sup>5</sup> Available at [https://unfccc.int/sites/default/files/resource/20231024\\_True-up%2023%20period%20report\\_Liechtenstein.pdf](https://unfccc.int/sites/default/files/resource/20231024_True-up%2023%20period%20report_Liechtenstein.pdf).

<sup>6</sup> [FCCC/KP/CMP/2023/TPR/LIE](https://unfccc.int/sites/default/files/resource/20231024_True-up%2023%20period%20report_Liechtenstein.pdf), para. 6 and table 1.

<sup>7</sup> [FCCC/KP/CMP/2023/TPR/LIE](https://unfccc.int/sites/default/files/resource/20231024_True-up%2023%20period%20report_Liechtenstein.pdf), para. 8.



---

**COMPLIANCE COMMITTEE  
OF THE KYOTO PROTOCOL**

**CC/EB/39/2024/2  
16 December 2024**

a decision on a preliminary examination with respect to Liechtenstein.<sup>8</sup> On the same day, Liechtenstein, as the Party concerned, was notified in writing of the decision.

15. At its 39<sup>th</sup> meeting, the branch considered a presentation by the secretariat summarizing the status of the question of implementation with respect to Liechtenstein, including the procedural steps to be taken in accordance with the procedures and mechanisms and the rules of procedure after a question of implementation has been raised.

16. At the same meeting, a representative of Liechtenstein was present and reiterated the Party's willingness and readiness to make the necessary retirements as soon as retirements are allowed again.

17. Representatives of the secretariat's Transparency and Mitigation divisions who coordinated the review of the report upon expiration of the additional period for fulfilling commitments for the second commitment period of the Kyoto Protocol of Liechtenstein submitted in 2023 answered questions asked at the meeting.

18. As per section IX, paragraph 4, of the procedures and mechanisms, the branch is to consider the question of implementation with regard to Liechtenstein and adopt a decision on this matter at its 40<sup>th</sup> meeting. The 40<sup>th</sup> meeting of the branch will likely take place virtually towards the end of September 2024.

**5. Other matters**

19. With the additional period for fulfilling commitments for the second commitment period having expired and no third commitment period in place, the enforcement branch proposed to discuss, among other matters, its future workload in response to the mandates in the procedures and mechanisms and the rules of procedure and to make recommendations to the plenary thereon as appropriate.

20. To facilitate the discussion on its future workload, among other matters, the branch agreed to hold a meeting in hybrid format in the second half of 2025, in conjunction with the meeting of the plenary. The enforcement branch authorized the chairperson and vice-chairperson to set a date for that meeting when considering that matter at the 26<sup>th</sup> meeting of the plenary.

21. No other matters were raised.

**6. Closure of the meeting**

22. The chairperson of the branch declared the 39<sup>th</sup> meeting closed on 2 July 2024.

---

<sup>8</sup> Compliance Committee document CC-2024-1-2/Liechtenstein/EB.



---

**COMPLIANCE COMMITTEE  
OF THE KYOTO PROTOCOL**

**CC/EB/39/2024/2  
16 December 2024**

**Annex I: Election of chairperson and vice-chairperson**



---

**COMPLIANCE COMMITTEE**

**CC/EB/2024/1  
15 May 2024**

***ENFORCEMENT BRANCH***

**Report on election by electronic means**

**Election of chairperson and vice-chairperson**

The enforcement branch has elected Mr. Arne Riedel as chairperson and Ms. Paulette Bynoe as vice-chairperson using electronic means.

-----



**COMPLIANCE COMMITTEE  
OF THE KYOTO PROTOCOL**

**CC/EB/39/2024/2  
16 December 2024**

**Annex II: Attendance**

The table below presents the members and alternate members of the enforcement branch. The names of those present at the meeting are bolded below.

<b>Members (in alphabetical order)</b>	<b>Alternate Members</b>
1. ALAM, Mohammad Sa'dat Mr.	<b>MASSAI, Leonardo Mr.</b>
2. <b>BYNOE, Paulette Ms.</b>	<b>Grullon de la Cruz, FEDERICO Mr.</b>
3. DALLORA, Loredana Ms. (member ad interim)	<i>vacant</i>
4. <b>NATIFU, Bob Mr.</b>	<b>WAMUKOYA, George Mr.</b>
5. <b>NGUYEN-BLOCH, Sébastien Mr.</b>	<b>ANTTONEN, Karoliina Ms.</b>
6. <b>ODERSON, Derrick Mr.</b>	<b>PANDA, Rensie Ms.</b>
7. <b>RAJABI, Ahmad Mr.</b>	<b>MOUSSA, Ba Mr.</b>
8. <b>RIEDEL, Arne Mr.</b>	<b>ZAHARIA, Felix Mr.</b>
9. <b>RUDZKO, Iryna Ms.</b>	<i>vacant</i>
10. <b>WARGAHADIBRATA, Ratnasari Ms.</b> (member ad interim)	<i>vacant</i>