APA 1.5
30 April - 10 May 2018
Bonn, Germany

## Draft elements of APA agenda item 7

Modalities and procedures for the effective operation of the committee to facilitate implementation and promote compliance referred to in Article 15.2 of the Paris Agreement

Informal note by the co-facilitators
First iteration (4 May 2018 at 22:40)


#### Abstract

These draft texts have been prepared by the co-facilitators of the negotiations on this agenda item under their own responsibility and on the basis of the Informal Note by the co-facilitators issued at APA 1.4 (Final version of 13 November 2017), ${ }^{1}$ deliberations by Parties at this session and the views they have submitted. The flow of section III of the Informal Note and most of its parts has been revised with a view to developing a textual narrative, while sections I and II remain unchanged from the Informal Note of APA 1.4.

The parts of section III that have been changed vis-à-vis the 'Tool to illustrate a possible flow of section III of the Informal Note of APA 1.4' (published on the APA item 7 website on 4 May 2018 at 00:15) are highlighted in grey. The use of tables in section III (D) and $(E)$ is to assist with representing possible options in a more user-friendly manner. It does not imply any difference in status of those parts vis-à-vis other parts of section III. These texts are preliminary and should not be considered as final in any way; they are offered as a basis for work and do not prejudge further work or prevent Parties from expressing their views in the future. It is recognized that the outcome of deliberations on this item will form part of the overall outcome under the Paris Agreement work programme.


## I. INTRODUCTION / MANDATE / PURPOSE

Article 15, paragraph 1, of the Paris Agreement established a mechanism to facilitate implementation and promote compliance with the provisions of the Agreement. In accordance with Article 15, paragraph 2, of the Agreement, this mechanism will consist of a committee (hereinafter 'the Committee') that shall be expert-based and facilitative in nature and function in a manner that is transparent, non-adversarial and non-punitive, paying particular attention to the respective national capabilities and circumstances of Parties.

Article 15, paragraph 3, of the Agreement specifies that the Committee operate under the modalities and procedures to be adopted at CMA1 and is to report annually to the CMA.
Paragraph 102 of decision 1/CP. 21 specifies that the Committee is to have 12 members to be elected on the basis of equitable geographical representation.

[^0]The COP, through paragraph 103 of the same decision, requested the APA to develop modalities and procedures for the effective operation of the Committee, with a view to the APA completing its work on such modalities and procedures for consideration and adoption at CMA1.

During the fourth part of the first session of the Ad-hoc Working Group on the Paris Agreement (APA 1.4), held in November 2017, Parties continued to discuss possible modalities and procedures for the effective operation of the Committee to facilitate implementation and promote compliance referred to in Article 15.2 of the Paris Agreement.

## II. CROSS-CUTting and overarching considerations / relevant context / general elements

National capabilities and circumstances
Parties were of the view that national capabilities and circumstances (NCCs) will apply to the modalities and procedures of the Committee, in accordance with the provisions of the Paris Agreement. Parties have different views on how NCCs can be operationalized by the modalities and procedures of the Committee. Some were of the view that NCCs will apply through guidance to the Committee in its modalities and procedures, while others consider that the Committee will apply NCCs on a case-by-case basis. Some Parties consider that the modalities and procedures will differentiate between developed and developing country Parties, while others were of the view that this is not appropriate as the distinction is not made in the text of Article 15.

## Interlinkages with other arrangements

Parties recognize that the Committee may have direct and indirect linkages with other arrangements under the Paris Agreement, and established under the Convention. Parties also recognize the relationship between the Committee and support arrangements. How this relation can be operationalized needs to be explored. Some Parties consider there to be strong linkages to arrangements under other Articles of the Paris Agreement - including, but not limited to, the enhanced transparency framework (Article 13), the global stocktake (Article 14) and under Article 6. Some Parties also consider there to be strong linkages to bodies that serve the Paris Agreement as provided by decision 1/CP.21, including but not limited to the Forum for Response Measures, the Standing Committee on Finance, the Technology Executive Committee, and the Warsaw International Mechanism for Loss and Damage associated with Climate Change Impacts. Parties recognize that further work is required to understand how these potential linkages can be operationalized through the modalities and procedures of the Committee, but some note that it was too early to consider this in detail.

## Discretion

Parties also consider what degree of discretion the Committee will have, and how this may be bounded through the modalities and procedures. Some Parties feel that the Committee should be given the mandate to keep its modalities and procedures under review, while others consider this to be a matter for the CMA alone. Some Parties consider that the modalities and procedures should prescribe the actions and processes of the Committee, for example that all stages of the process should flow from how action by the Committee was initiated. While other Parties consider that much of this work on the rules of procedure can be left for the Committee to determine - within boundaries.

Parties consider whether the modalities and procedures to be considered and adopted by CMA1 will address all possible elements in a comprehensive way, or whether some questions would be best resolved after CMA1 and/or when the Committee begins to meet. Some Parties consider that full and comprehensive modalities and procedures must be adopted by CMA1, while others consider that these will continue to be developed as appropriate over time.

## Principles

Some Parties are of the view that the modalities and procedures require a section on principles that should guide the Committee. Some consider that this should include equity and common but differentiated responsibilities and respective capabilities, in the light of different national circumstances. Others consider that this section would not be required as differentiation is embedded in the provisions of the Paris Agreement, and that the principles that should guide the Committee are included in Article 15. Some Parties also raised other principles, such as transparency, complementarity, independence, and the need to add value and avoid duplication of other arrangements, should also form part of any principles.

## III. ELEMENTS OF RELEVANT GUIDANCE ${ }^{2}$

## A. Purpose, principles and nature

## A. 1 Purpose

- Facilitate implementation and promote compliance (Art 15.1) ${ }^{3}$
- Encourage, assist and enable Parties to implement provisions and comply with their obligations
- Prevent situations of non-implementation or non-compliance
- Preventive role is inconsistent with the facilitative and non-adversarial nature of the Committee
- Thereby:
- Enhance effectiveness and durability of the Agreement
- Enhance credibility, confidence, consistency and effectiveness of actions, and trust among Parties
- Complement other processes and mechanisms under the PA and the Convention
- Avoid politicization


## A. 2 Principles

1. Established under the Paris Agreement (PA)

- Nothing in the design or operations of the Art 15 Mechanism can change the content or legal character of the PA's provisions.

2. Paris Agreement and Convention principles:

Views:

[^1]- (1) Art 15 Mechanism must reflect equity and the principle of common but differentiated responsibilities and respective capabilities (CBDR-RC) in line with the Convention
- The modalities need to respect and be informed by the principles, including with regard to nature, scope, functions, commencement, measures/outputs, and procedures
- This includes differentiation between developed and developing countries
- (2) The PA already reflects CBDR-RC in the light of different national circumstances: no further reflection in the modalities
- Differentiation is already embedded in the PA provisions, and is embedded in Article 15 in a particular way.
- Art 15 mechanism is applicable to all Parties
- (3) Reference to Articles 2 and 15

3. Other relevant principles:

Views:

- transparency
- non-duplication of effort/complementarity
- effectiveness
- independence
- inclusiveness


## A. 3 Nature

- Functioning in a facilitative, transparent, non-adversarial, non-punitive manner (Art 15.2)
- Expert-based and facilitative (Art 15.2)
- Paying particular attention to the respective national capabilities and circumstances of Parties (Art 15.2)
- Transparent (see below: Procedural matters) (Art 15.2)
- Non-punitive (Art 15.2), i.e.:
- No enforcement
- No penalties or sanctions
- Non-adversarial, (Art 15.2), i.e.:
- Not a mechanism to settle disputes
- Respecting national sovereignty
- Consultative
- Advisory


## B. Functions

Facilitate implementation and promote compliance (Art 15.1):
Views

- (1) Two distinct functions:

With differences based on scope, triggers, and/or measures;

- (1.1) As a dual function; distinct but complementary; may not be mutually exclusive;
- (1.2) Two distinct roles, reflecting differentiated approach throughout PA and national circumstances;
- (2) Continuum within the spectrum of functions:
- With the difference being determined by the legal nature of the provision in question:
- Facilitation and compliance for legally binding provisions; only facilitation for nonlegally binding
- With the difference being determined by what is the appropriate measure/output in each case
- (3) One function: with no difference in measures/outputs as its outcomes are advisory and nonbinding

NCC: to be taken into account in the exercise of its functions / Whether and how to operationalize this element under this section to be explored

## C. Institutional arrangements

## Composition (1/CP.21, para 102)

The Committee to be comprised of twelve members with recognized competence in relevant scientific, technical, socioeconomic or legal fields to be elected by the CMA on the basis of equitable geographical representation, with two members each from the five regional groups of the United Nations and one member each from the small island developing States and the least developed countries, while taking into account the goal of gender balance.

## Members / alternates and expert based nature

Option A: Members of the Committee
Option B: Members and an alternate for each member of the Committee

- to be elected by the CMA
- taking into account the expert-based nature of the Committee in accordance with Article 15 of the Parties Agreement
- giving consideration to diversity of the relevant fields of expertise


## Term of office, stagqered election for continuity

- Members / and alternate members / to be elected to serve for a period of three years and be eligible to serve a maximum of two consecutive terms
- Six members / and six alternate members / to be elected at CMA x initially for a term of two years and six members and alternate members for a term of three years
- Thereafter, the CMA to elect at each of its regular sessions six members / and alternate members / for a period of three years
- The members / and alternate members / to remain in office until their successors are elected


## Resignation / replacement

- If a member / or an alternate member / resigns or is otherwise unable to complete the term of office or to perform the functions of that office, the Committee may decide, bearing in mind the proximity of the next session of the CMA, to appoint a member / or an alternate member / from the same group or constituency to replace said member for the remainder of that member's / alternate member's / mandate
- Such term of office to count as one term


## Individual vs expert capacity

Members of the Committee / and their alternate members / to serve in their

Option A: individual capacity
Option B: expert capacity
Option C: individual, expert capacity

## Bureau: election, term of office and geographical representation

## Option A:

- The Committee to elect from amongst its members for a period of two/three years the Chair and Vice-Chair as well as three other members to serve as the Bureau of the Committee
- In electing the Bureau, the Committee to ensure equitable representation of the five regional groups of the United Nations
- The positions of the Chair and Vice Chair to alternate between a member from a developed country Party and a developing country Party
[placeholder for any additional functions of the Bureau that may not be addressed elsewhere in the modalities and procedures]
Option B: No bureau provisions in the modalities


## Option C:

- The Committee to elect from amongst its members for a period of two/three years the Chair and Vice-Chair
- The chairing shall rotate between Parties representing developed and developing countries.


## Frequency of meetings

- Unless otherwise decided, the Committee to meet:

Option A: at least once a year
Option B: at least twice a year

- Beginning in:

Option A: 2019
Option B: 2020

## Open or closed meetings

Meetings of the Committee to be
Option A: \{open as default\}

- held in public
- unless the Committee, of its own accord or at the request of the Party concerned, decides for part or all of the meeting to be held in private
- only members / and alternate members / of the Committee and secretariat officials to be present during the elaboration and adoption of a decision of the Committee


## Option B: \{closed as default\}

- held in a closed session, subject to the provisions of the present modalities and procedures on the participation of the Party concerned
- the Committee of its own accord, at the request of the Party or otherwise concerned, may invite the Party concerned to participate in a part of its meeting
- only members / and alternate members / of the Committee and secretariat officials to be present during the elaboration and adoption of a decision of the Committee

Adoption of decisions by the Committee requires a quorum of at least
Option A: three fourths of the members to be present
Option B: ten members to be present

## Decision-making

## The Committee to

Option A: \{consensus\}

- reach agreement on any decision by consensus

Option B: \{consensus, with voting as last resort\}

- make every effort to reach agreement on any decision by consensus
- if all efforts at reaching consensus have been exhausted, as a last resort, the decisions to be adopted by a majority of
- Option 1: the members present and voting
- Option 2: at least two-third of the members present and voting
- Option 3: at least three-fourth of the members present and voting
- Option 4: at least nine of the members present and voting


## Conduct of work and decision-making through electronic means of communication

- Possibility to conduct its work, including with regard to elaboration and adoption of decisions, using electronic means of communication, subject to provisions of these modalities and procedures with respect to participation of the Party concerned.
- Such decisions to be deemed taken at the headquarters of the secretariat


## Reasoning

Any decisions of the Committee concerning facilitation of implementation and promotion of compliance by Parties to be made in writing and supported by reasoning

## Conflict of interest

Members / and alternate members / to

- disclose any interest in any matter under discussion before the Committee which may constitute a conflict of interest or which might be incompatible with the requirements of independence and impartiality expected of a member / or alternate member / of the Committee
- refrain from participating in the work of the Committee in relation to such matter

Members / and alternate members / are considered to have a conflict of interest when their country is the Party concerned.

## Rules of procedure of the Committee

## Option A: \{Committee to develop proposal for CMA\}

The Committee to develop its rules of procedure for consideration and adoption by the CMA 2

- informed by the principles of transparency, facilitation, the non-adversarial and non-punitive function, and taking into account national capabilities and circumstances
Such rules of procedure may also include some of the elements included above in this section (e.g. replacement of members, electronic modes of work, conflict of interest procedures)


## Option B: \{Rules of procedure to be elaborated in this text\}

The elements may need to include the following issues (indicative, non-exhaustive list):

- Dates for start and end of terms of office of members
- Details on the role of alternate members, if alternate members are included
- Oath of service provisions
- Further details on how conflict of interest issues could be addressed
- Elaboration on the replacement of Bureau officers
- Elaboration on the tasks of the Bureau
- Details on the timing of document circulation
- Process of elaboration of meeting agenda
- Timelines for circulation for specific categories of documents to members
- Timelines for circulation of specific documents and other notifications to Parties
- Details on how timeframes are to be calculated, e.g. taking into account working days and holidays
- Detailed procedures for the use of electronic means of decision-making: what types of decision, what procedures, etc.
- Place of meetings
- Attendance requirements
- Working language
D. Scope and initiation of consideration

| Option A: Self-referral only | Option B: Other means of initiation in addition to self-referral |
| :---: | :---: |
| Self-referral only: Committee activity may be initiated by the Party concerned with respect to its own implementation or compliance with any of the provisions of the Paris Agreement | (Options below are not necessarily mutually exclusive): <br> Option 1: Initiation by another Party/by a group of Parties: \{SCOPE to be further elaborated\} <br> Option 2: Initiation by the Committee: |
|  | - On the basis of: <br> - Information from the NDC registry <br> - Status reports prepared by the Secretariat on submissions under transparency arrangements of Art 13 $\leftrightarrow \rightarrow^{4}$ <br> - Technical expert review reports under the transparency arrangements of Art $13 \leftrightarrow \rightarrow$ <br> - Information provided by other bodies, mechanisms and arrangements under PA $\leftrightarrow \rightarrow$ |

[^2]

## E. Process

Option A: The Committee may be given bounded discretion to decide on the details of the process subject to guidelines to be included in this section.

## Option B:

Steps/phases (not necessarily consecutive)

| For Option A of initiation (Self-referral only) | For Option B of initiation (Other means of <br> initiation in addition to self-referral) |
| :--- | :--- |
| Verification of sufficient information: | Determination of admissibility (including |
| To the best of its capacity, Party concerned to |  |
| whether the matter that is before is based on <br> provide information on efforts made to use <br> the provisions of the Paris Agreement, is |  |


| how the matter is based on the provisions the Paris Agreement | supported by sufficient information, is not de minimis or ill-founded) |
| :---: | :---: |
|  | Notification to the Party concerned |
| Any additional questions to Party concerned <br> - Flexibility regarding timelines for respons | Invite Party to provide written inputs/comments - Flexibility regarding timelines for response |
| Consent of the Party concerned at every stag Option A: required Option B: not required Option $C$ : required in certain situatio | the process: |
| The Committee to take into account the national capabilities and circumstances of the Party concerned at all stages of the process |  |
| Obtaining information from the relevant sou Assistance provided to a Party during the pro support to enable participation <br> Dialogue with Party concerned (of facilitative <br> - Consultation at different stages <br> - Possibility to make written inputs <br> - Representation at meetings, including rig respond (including via video) <br> - Possibility/right to request a hearing/an <br> - Possibility to invite other bodies when ne | (see subsection on sources of information) before the Committee, including possibility of ure) <br> o make representations and opportunity to tional meeting |
| - Possibility to invite other Parties when appropriate |  |
| Identification of causes, challenges and constraints (in consultation with the Party concerned) <br> Identification of measures/outputs |  |
| Committee, when identifying appropriate me $\circ$ National capabilities and circumstanc $\circ \quad$ Lack of capacity versus lack of will $\circ \quad$ Capacities and technology needs of d | NCC) <br> loping countries |
| - Capacities and technology challenges |  |
| - Type, degree and frequency of the failure to facilitate implementation of and promote compliance with the provisions of the Agreement |  |
| - Based on whether developed country - Special circumstances of LDCs and SIDS - Impact of response measures - Other relevant national circumstance | .g. force majeure, to be taken into account |
| Preliminary outputs to be sent to Party concerned for |  |
| Option A: comments |  |

## F. Measures and outputs

## For Options A and B of initiation (see section D above)

Range of measures (not necessarily mutually exclusive or consecutive):
Sharing of information, experience and lessons learned
Identification of challenges faced by the Party concerned
Action plan/Implementation plan/Compliance plan:

- Initiation/request for elaboration of implementation/compliance plan - Views:
- (1) Whether only upon request by the Party concerned
- (2) Whether also by the Committee
* (2.1) With consent of the Party concerned
* (2.1) Without need for consent in case of non-compliance
- Overall purpose of the plan
- Facilitative
- A roadmap developed in collaboration with the Party concerned to assist the Party with implementation or compliance with the PA
- Advisory
- Possible elements of the plan:
- Description of implementation challenges/causes of non-compliance
- Description of measures the Party intends to take to improve implementation/achieve compliance
- Timelines
- Follow-up arrangements (including information to Committee about progress)
- Development of the plan
- By the Party concerned in consultation with the Committee
- With Committee's assistance, if requested by the Party concerned
- In a way that is respectful of the nationally determined nature of the NDCs

Recommendations and suggestions (to the Party concerned)
Information and advice

## Support:

Option A: Information on accessing support, e.g. types of support available, subject to:
$\leftrightarrow$
Option B: Facilitating access to finance, technology and capacity-building support, subject to: $\leftrightarrow \rightarrow$

- Safeguards to avoid creating perverse incentive to be considered
- Possible requirements to exhaust efforts under other arrangements
- No requirement to exhaust efforts or placing the burden on the Party. Party shall be able to initiate the facilitation by the Committee without prejudice to any other efforts
- Referring to appropriate bodies for finance, technology and capacity-building support $\leftrightarrow \rightarrow$
- Access to/refer to/send technical experts to assist Party concerned
- Recommendations to relevant bodies related to support

Statement/Declaration/Finding on non-compliance

## For Option B of initiation (Means of initiation other than self-referral)

In selecting any of the following measures, taking into account:

- Causes, degree, nature and frequency of non-compliance

Early warning / Notification to the Party concerned:
Statements of concern / Cautionary statements:
Confidential letter
Declarations/Findings/Communications in relation to compliance:

- Would not be consistent with facilitative and non-punitive nature
- Factual findings related to compliance without an affirmative statement of non-compliance
- Any measures related with Art 6 PA:

Views:

- Possible elements reflecting any linkages to Article 6 (could be further explored)
- No linkages to Article 6

Follow-up by the Committee

## Option A:

- Should be facilitative in nature
- Discretion would be needed to allow Committee to decide on its working methods
- Additional guidelines would be necessary with some further steps and measures for the Committee
- May depend on measures taken
- Initiation of a follow-up may/shall require consent by the Party concerned

Option B: No follow-up provisions required

## G. Identification of systemic issues

Systemic issues include:
Option A: General problems / common source of difficulty for implementation and compliance, faced by a number of Parties in relation to any provisions of the Paris Agreement
Option B: Also recurrent, repetitive and systemic issues of implementation by of a Party or group of Parties in relation to any provisions of the Paris Agreement

Consideration of a systemic issue may be initiated:
Option A: By the CMA
Option B: By the Committee
Option 1: based on systemic challenges identified in the course of its work
Option 2: for certain areas for which it has mandate from the CMA
Option 3: upon decision of its bureau
Option C: At a request of a group of Parties

## Process and outputs:

- Gather information from relevant sources (see list of sources in Section $H$ below)
- With respect to consideration initiated by the CMA or the Committee, the Committee prepares conclusions and recommendations to be included in a report to the CMA
- With respect to consideration initiated at the request by a group of Parties, the Committee makes recommendation to groups of Parties concerned
- The Committee may be given bounded discretion to decide on the details of the process for consideration of systemic issue subject to guidelines to be included in these modalities
- Could serve as background information for Global Stocktake $\leftrightarrow \rightarrow$
- Could inform other subsidiary bodies and constituted bodies, support arrangements and other arrangements under the Paris Agreement $\leftrightarrow$
- Could take into account the impact of response measures and other relevant factors


## H. Sources of information

Drawing on additional expertise
Safeguards for confidential information

- In particular, for how to engage with Party concerned, and specific facilitative measures

Possible sources of information

- Information provided by the Party/Parties concerned
- Registries under the Paris Agreement $\leftrightarrow \rightarrow$
- NDCs; Parties' communications $\leftrightarrow \rightarrow$
- Information from the transparency framework, e.g. from the technical expert teams $\leftrightarrow \rightarrow$
- Information subsidiary and constituted bodies and other bodies and institutional arrangements under and/or serving the Paris Agreement $\leftrightarrow \rightarrow$
- Information made available by the Secretariat

Modalities and procedures could identify information required at the initiation stage. For other information, certain degree of discretion could be given to the Committee.
I. Relationship with the Conference of the Parties serving as the meeting of the Parties to the Paris Agreement

- Committee under the guidance of CMA
- Reports annually to CMA (Art 15.3)
- Content of reporting (views not necessarily mutually exclusive): Views:
(1) Reports on its work
- Not individualizing
- (2) Reporting on findings/measures in individual cases:
- (2.1) Reports on all to CMA
- (2.2) Informs CMA only if requested by the Party concerned
- (3) A summary of its activities and actions taken
- (4) Reports to flag systemic issues
- (4.1) Systemic issues involving a number of Parties
- (4.2) Recurring implementation/compliance issues of a Party
- Recommendations to the CMA (views not necessarily mutually exclusive):
- (1) If Committee considers the measures implicate important issues under the PA or the authority of other PA bodies
- (2) In case of non-compliance of Party concerned: to provide technical assistance; capacity-building
- (3) In cases of repeated non-compliance
- (4) In cases of systemic issues regarding implementation and compliance
- (5) On overcoming systemic barriers to implementation and compliance
- (6) Only at the request of the Party concerned; and the CMA is not required to take any decision
- CMA to take note of (views):
- Committee's findings in individual cases
- Taking note of Committee's findings in individual cases is inconsistent with the nature of the Article 15 Committee


## J. Review of the modalities and procedures

## Views

- Built-in review based on the experience with the Article 15 Committee and other relevant arrangements
- Periodic review of the modalities and procedures by CMA
- Review by the Committee itself, with recommendations subject to approval by the CMA


## K. Secretariat

- Secretariat support


[^0]:    ${ }^{1}$ https://unfccc.int/files/na/application/pdf/apa 7 informalnote final version.pdf.

[^1]:    ${ }^{2}$ Headings, subheadings and formatting are without prejudice to the eventual modalities and procedures and are intended as a tool to collect and organize issues for the purposes of this document.
    ${ }^{3}$ References to articles (Art) are to those of the Paris Agreement (PA).

[^2]:    ${ }^{4} \leftarrow \rightarrow$ Possible elements reflecting any linkages (could be further explored).

