

UNFCCC

FRAMEWORK CONVENTION ON CLIMATE CHANGE – Secretariat CONVENTION - CADRE SUR LES CHANGEMENTS CLIMATIQUES – Secrétariat

UNFCCC ITL Administrator

Standard Independent Assessment Report Assessment Report Part 1 - Completeness

Reference:	IAR/2009FRA/1/1		
Version number:	2.0	State:	FINAL
Prepared by:	George Nicholas Nelson/Norway	Date:	11/06/2010
Reviewed by:	Chris Collins/PQA		13/06/2010
Approved by:	Vitaly Matsarski/UNFCCC,		

Circulation list		
Name/Role	Organization	Info/Action
George Nicholas Nelson / Assessor	Climate and Pollution Agency Norway	Info
Chris Collins / Reviewer Mr. Oliver Guittet / French Registry	PQA	Review
Administrator	CDC	

Document change record

Version	Date	Description
0.1	30/04/2010	First draft
0.2	06/05/2010	Reviewed first draft
0.3	10/05/2010	Final draft for review
1.0	11/05/2010	Version 1.0
1.1	11/06/2010	Updated assessment to include feedback in consultation form
2.0	13/06/2010	Final Version 2.0 – edits and clarifications

Summary

Ref Nr	Description	Value	Comments
P1.0.1	Party name	France	
P1.0.2	Reporting period	2009	
P1.0.3	Submission	Files submitted:	Information from the ITL
	under review	- [SEF] SEF-FR-2010_1_9-45-12	Administrator:
		14-4-2010.xls	- [RRITL] SIAR_Reports_2009_ FR_v1.1.xls
		- [REPORTS] SIAR Reports 2009- FR v1.0.xls	_ - [SEFCR] FRA_SEF_2010_1_ 9-
		- [NIR-FR] FRANCE_NIR.doc	45-12 14-4-2010-CR.xls
		- [NIR-EN] FRANCEchap12- 14englishversion.doc (unofficial English translation)	
		- EN_REGREG.xls	
		- [RESPONSE] SIAR Consultation Form on Draft Part 1 FRA.	
P1.0.4	Previous annual review report reference	FCCC/ARR/2009/FRA (18/03/2010)	

Table of Contents

1.	Introduction	4
1.1	. Overall assessment	4
2.	Accounting of Kyoto Protocol units	5
3.	National Registry Change	.10
4.	Public information	.13
5.	Previous Expert Review Team recommendations	.27

1. Introduction

The SIAR Part 1 report assesses the completeness of a Party's annual submission with regard to its national registry. Each section contains questions related to the specific items to be assessed.

1.1. Overall assessment

Ref Nr	Requirement	Assessment
P1.1.1	Submission complete?	
	Information has been provided pursuant to paragraphs 11 to 18 in section I.E of the annex to decision 15/CMP.1, paragraph 32 in section II.E of the annex to decision 15/CMP.1 and the further guidance by the SIAR guidelines?	[]Yes [x]No
P1.1.2	Public Information Provided?	
	Information has been provided pursuant to paragraphs 44 to 48 in section I.E of the annex to decision 13/CMP.1?	[]Yes [x]No
P1.1.3	Explanation of how the previous Annual Review recommendations have been addressed?	[]Yes [x]No []NA

2. Accounting of Kyoto Protocol units

The purpose of this section is to indicate whether information has been reported by the Party in its annual submission pursuant to paragraphs 11 to 18 in section I.E of the annex to decision 15/CMP.1.

Ref Nr	Requirement	Assessment	Comments			
15/CMP.1 annex I.E paragraph 11						
Standard	d electronic format (SEF)					
P1.2.1	14/CMP.1 annex I. paragraph 3					
	Has the Party transferred or acquired any Kyoto Protocol units in the reporting period or in any year prior to the reporting year?	[x]Yes[]No	The Party has transferred or acquired Kyoto Protocol units during or prior to the reported period as indicated in [SEF] and [SEFCR].			
	(If yes, Party is required to submit the SEF report)					
P1.2.2	15/CMP.1 annex I.E paragraph 11					
	Has the Party provided a report in the SEF containing the information required by paragraph 11 of the annex to decision 15/CMP.1?	[x]Yes []No	The Party's SEF report [SEF] was made available to assessors by 18/04/2010.			
	(Yes is also indicated when the Party has not submitted a SEF and was not required to do so)					
15/CMP.1	1 annex I.E paragraph 12					
Discrepa	int transactions					
P1.2.3	Has the transaction log identified discrepancies in transactions proposed by the Party?	[x]Yes []No	The Report R2 of RRITL shows that the transaction log identified discrepancies in transactions proposed by the Party.			

Ref Nr	Requirement	Assessment	Comments
P1.2.4	Has Party reported all discrepancies as required by paragraph 12 of the annex to decision 15/CMP.1?	[]Yes [x]No	The reported information on discrepant transactions does not match the ITL records (see [RRITL], report R-2). The Party has not reported all discrepant transaction Discrepant transactions during the period 01/01/2009 – 28/02/2009 was not reported.
			The Party informs in the [RESPONSE] document that the previous report R2 sent to the Secretariat for year 2008 covered the period from 16/10/2008 to 28/02/09, and hence believe that the next reported period should start after the end of the previous reported period (i.e. first of March 2009).
			The Party should report all discrepant transactions which occurred during the reported period (1/1/2009 – 31/12/2009), even though discrepant transactions for parts of the 2009 previously have been reported.
15/CMP.	1 annex I.E paragraph 13		
Reversal	of storage notifications		
P1.2.5	Has the transaction log issued reversal of storage notifications to the Party's national registry?	[]Yes [x]No	The ITL identified no reversal of storage notifications to the Party's national registry during the reported period (see [RRITL], Report R-3).
P1.2.6	Has Party reported all notifications directing it to replace ICERs in accordance with paragraph 49 of the annex to decision 5/CMP.1?	[x]Yes []No	The Party informs in the [RESPONSE] document that no type 4 notifications (Reversal of storage for CDM Project) were received by the National Registry during the reported period pursuant of 15/CMP.1 annex I.E paragraph 13 & 14.
15/CMP.	1 annex I.E paragraph 14		
Non-cert	ification notifications		
P1.2.7	Has the transaction log issued non-certification notifications to the Party's national registry?	[]Yes [x]No	The ITL identified no non-certification notifications to the Party's national registry during the reported period (see [RRITL], Report R-3).

Ref Nr	Requirement	Assessment	Comments
P1.2.8	Has the Party reported all notifications to replace ICERs in accordance with paragraph 50 of the annex to decision 5/CMP.1?	[x]Yes []No	The Party informs in the [RESPONSE] document that no type 5 notifications (Non-submission of Certification Report for CDM Project) were received by the national registry during the reported period pursuant of 15/CMP.1 annex I.E paragraph 13 & 14.
15/CMP.1	1 annex I.E paragraph 15		
Non-repl	acement		
P1.2.9	Has the transaction log a record of non-replacement for this Party?	[]Yes [x]No	The ITL identified no non-replacement notifications to the Party's national registry during the reported period (see [RRITL], Report R-3).
P1.2.10	Has Party reported all non-replacements in accordance with paragraph 56 of the annex to decision 5/CMP.1?	[x]Yes []No	The Party informs in the [RESPONSE] document that no non- replacements occurred during the reported period, pursuant of 15/CMP.1 annex I.E paragraph 15.

Ref Nr	Requirement	Assessment	Comments				
15/CMP.1	5/CMP.1 annex I.E paragraph 16						
Inconsist	tencies from discrepant transactions						
P1.2.11	Has the transaction log identified discrepant transactions proposed by the Party that were not terminated or cancelled?	[]Yes [x]No	The ITL did not identify discrepant transactions proposed by the Party that were not terminated or cancelled.				
P1.2.12	Has Party reported on units that are not valid for use towards compliance with commitments under Article 3, paragraph 1, pursuant to paragraph 43 (b) of the annex to decision 13/CMP.1?	[x]Yes []No	The Party informs in the [RESPONSE] document that no invalid units exist at 31 December 2009, pursuant of 15/CMP.1 annex I.E paragraph 16.				
	I annex I.E paragraph 17 and changes to address discrepancies						
P1.2.13	Has Party reported actions taken to correct any problem that caused a discrepancy to occur, any changes to the national registry to prevent a discrepancy from reoccurring, or the resolution of any previously identified questions of implementation pertaining to transactions?	[x]Yes []No	In NIR-EN, the Party reported on preventive and corrective actions which have been taken to minimize the number of discrepancies. Furthermore, the Party has reported that it is actively participating in international forums to improve the registry system and its guidelines.				
15/CMP.1	l annex I.E paragraph 18		1				
CPR Calc	culation						

Party has reported in the document NIR-EN section 12.5 that PR is calculated on the basis of AAUs according to the ion 11/CMP.1 paragraph 6, and that the CPR amount is equal 37,663,976 t eq. CO_2 . It also states that using the 2008 tory leads to a 2634145,70 t éq CO_2 which is superior to the
alculated on the basis of AAU's. ever, the actual calculation of the Party's commitment period we is not available in this submission. The Party should report PR calculation as required by 15/CMP.1 annex I.E paragraph d as referenced on Page 6 of the SIAR Reporting irements and Guidance for Registries v4.3. Party notes in the [RESPONSE] document that it has followed equirements of 15/CMP.1 annex I.E and that the CPR as lated in the NIR-EN section 12.5 is based on AAU's and is to 2537663976 téq. CO2 (because the one calculated on the of 2008 inventory is higher). France believes that the CPR lation requirement has been fulfilled, but has not provided a iption of the formula and values used in the calculation.
alc ve PF d ire Par ar lat to flat

3. National Registry Change

If a change to a Party's national registry has been identified under paragraph 22 of the annex to decision 15/CMP.1 then information relating to this change should be submitted by the Party in accordance with paragraph 32 of the annex to decision 15/CMP.1.

The baseline for reporting changes of national registry is the information provided by the Party in its last submission.

Ref Nr	Requirement	Submission complete?	Item changed during reported period?	Comments
P1.3.1	15/CMP.1 annex II.E paragraph 32.(a) Change of name or contact Has the Party reported changes to the name or contact information of the registry administrator?	[x]Yes []No	[x]Yes []No	In NIR-EN section 12.1 the Party states that Mr. Olivier Guittet since 1 June 2009 has been the Registry administrator. His contact information is provided.
P1.3.2	15/CMP.1 annex II.E paragraph 32.(b)Change of cooperation arrangementHas the Party reported changes to the names of the other Parties with which they cooperate in maintaining their national registry consolidated?	[x]Yes []No	[]Yes [x]No	In NIR-EN section 12.1, the Party states that no changes have been made to its cooperation arrangements.
P1.3.3	15/CMP.1 annex II.E paragraph 32.(c) Change to the database or the capacity of National Registry Has the Party reported a change to the database structure or capacity of the national registry?	[x]Yes []No	[]Yes [x]No	In NIR-EN section 12.1, the Party states that no changes have been made to the database and capacity of its national registry.
P1.3.4	15/CMP.1 annex II.E paragraph 32.(d) Change of conformance to technical standards Has the Party reported a change to how the national registry conforms to the technical standards for data exchange between registry systems?	[x]Yes []No	[]Yes [x]No	In NIR-EN section 12.1, the Party states that no changes have been made to the conformance to technical standards by its national registry.

Ref Nr	Requirement	Submission complete?	Item changed during reported period?	Comments
P1.3.5	15/CMP.1 annex II.E paragraph 32.(e) Change of discrepancies procedures Has the Party reported a change to the procedures employed in the national registry to minimize discrepancies?	[x]Yes []No	[]Yes [x]No	In NIR-EN section 12.3, the Party states that no changes have been made to the procedures employed in its national registry to minimize discrepancies.
P1.3.6	 15/CMP.1 annex II.E paragraph 32.(f) Change of Security Has the Party reported a change to the security measures employed in the national registry to prevent unauthorized manipulations and to prevent operator error? 	[x]Yes []No	[]Yes [x]No	In NIR-EN section 12.3, the Party states that no changes have been made to the security measures employed in its national registry.
P1.3.7	15/CMP.1 annex II.E paragraph 32.(g) Change of list of publicly available information Has the Party reported a change to the list of publicly accessible information?	[x]Yes []No	[]Yes [x]No	The Party did not state whether any changes to the list of publicly accessible information has occurred or not. The Party should make a statement indicating whether there have been any changes to the publicly available information. If there have been changes, they should be reported accordingly. The Party informs in the [RESPONSE] document that no changes to the list of publicly available information have occurred since last submission.

Ref Nr	Requirement	Submission complete?	Item changed during reported period?	Comments
P1.3.8	15/CMP.1 annex II.E paragraph 32.(h) Change of Internet address Has the Party reported a change to the Internet address of the national registry?	[x]Yes []No	[]Yes [x]No	In NIR-EN section 12.1, the Party states that no changes have been made to the Internet address of its national registry.
P1.3.9	 15/CMP.1 annex II.E paragraph 32.(i) Change of data integrity measure Has the Party reported a change to the measures ensuring the integrity of data storage and the recovery of registry services in the event of a disaster? 	[x]Yes []No	[]Yes [x]No	In NIR-EN section 12.3, the Party states that no changes have been made to the data integrity measures.
P1.3.10	15/CMP.1 annex II.E paragraph 32.(j) Change of test results Has the Party reported a change to the results of any test procedures?	[x]Yes []No	[x]Yes []No	The Party has reported on the test plans and test reports conducted in connection with testing version 5.0 of the Seringas software

4. Public information

This section provides information on the completeness of public information provided pursuant to part E of the annex to 13/CMP.1, paragraphs 44 to 48 inclusive.

Paragraph 44 of the annex to decision 13/CMP.1 requires the national registry to make non-confidential information publicly available.

Ref Nr	Requirement	Submission complete	Has party identified this type of information confidential?	Comments
P1.4.1	13/CMP.1 Annex paragraph 45 Account information provided?	[x]Yes []No	[]Yes [x]No[]Partial	The Party provides reference to the publicly available information in NIR-EN section 12.4. From the main website: <u>https://www.seringas.caissedesdepots.fr</u> , click on the link Public reports. From this site, different reports can be downloaded (not available in Internet Explorer)
P1.4.1.1	13/CMP.1 Annex paragraph 45 (a) Account name: the holder of the account	[x]Yes []No	[]Yes [x]No []Partial	A report with a list of legal entities holding an account in the national registry (report no 1) can be downloaded from the Public reports site

Ref Nr	Requirement	Submission complete	Has party identified this type of information confidential?	Comments
P1.4.1.2	13/CMP.1 Annex paragraph 45 (b) Account type: the type of account (holding, cancellation or retirement)	[]Yes [x]No	[]Yes [x]No []Partial	A report with a list of legal entities holding an account in the national registry (report no 1) can be downloaded and viewed from the Public reports site.
				However, information on the type of account (holding, cancellation or retirement) is missing from the report.
				The Party informs in the [RESPONSE] document that only Parties are allowed to open cancellation, retirement and replacement accounts –other entities can only open holding accounts. This is according to EU regulations.
				The Party also notes in [RESPONSE] that the report called "List of accounts opened in the national registry" is temporally disbaled due to an issue in the reported data. This report contains information on the type of account and has not changed since the last submission. The Party refers to the website of CITL for public information on the accounts in the national registry.
P1.4.1.3	13/CMP.1 Annex paragraph 45 (c) Commitment period: the commitment period with which a cancellation or retirement account is associated	[]Yes [x]No	[]Yes [x]No []Partial	No information on cancellation and retirement accounts is provided on the public website, including information on the commitment period with which a cancellation and retirement account is associated.
				The Party informs in the [RESPONSE] document that the report "List of accounts opened in the national registry" is temporally disbaled due to an issue in the reported data. A new release is planned to be implemented by end of June.

Ref Nr	Requirement	Submission complete	Has party identified this type of information confidential?	Comments
P1.4.1.4	13/CMP.1 Annex paragraph 45 (d) Representative identifier: the representative of the account holder, using the Party identifier (the two- letter country code defined by ISO 3166) and a number unique to that representative within the Party's registry	[]Yes [x]No	[]Yes [x]No []Partial	No information on the unique identifier of the representatives of the accounts is given on the public website. The Party should publish the unique identifier of the representative of the account holder or state that this information is confidential.
P1.4.1.5	13/CMP.1 Annex paragraph 45 (e) Representative name and contact information; the full name, mailing address, telephone number, facsimile number and email address of the representative of the account holder	[x]Yes []No	[]Yes [x]No []Partial	A report with a list of legal entities holding an account in the national registry (report no 1) can be downloaded from the Public reports site. This report contains all the required contact information of the account holders.

Ref Nr	Requirement	Submission complete	Has party identified this type of information confidential?	Comments
P1.4.2	13/CMP.1 Annex paragraph 46 Article 6 project information provided?	[]Yes [x]No	[]Yes [x]No[]Partial	The Party refers to a website controlled by UNFCCC for this information. No information can be found on the website controlled by the Party. The Party should provide a reference to this information published on its own site(s).
				The Party informs in the [RESPONSE] document that the French DFP has no direct access to the registry's website (the Registry Administrator CDC is not part of the French administration), whereas the DFP can directly update the UNFCCC JI website. The Party has therefore decided, for the sake of simplicity, that all the relevant information on French JI projects will be displayed on the UNFCCC JI website.
				As stated in 44.2 in the SIAR Publicly Available Information Guidance v4.3 document, the Party should maintain its own website and have control of the public information. For clarity, the Party should not simply reference data published by a third-party (such as reports published on the UNFCCC website).

Ref Nr	Requirement	Submission complete	Has party identified this type of information confidential?	Comments
P1.4.2.1	13/CMP.1 Annex paragraph 46 (a) Project name: a unique name for the project	[]Yes [x]No	[]Yes [x]No []Partial	The Party refers to a website controlled by UNFCCC for this information. No information can be found on the website controlled by the Party. The Party should provide a reference to this information published on its own site(s).
				The Party informs in the [RESPONSE] document that the French DFP has no direct access to the registry's website (the Registry Administrator CDC is not part of the French administration), whereas the DFP can directly update the UNFCCC JI website. The Party has therefore decided, for the sake of simplicity, that all the relevant information on French JI projects will be displayed on the UNFCCC JI website.
				As stated in 44.2 in the SIAR Publicly Available Information Guidance v4.3 document, the Party should maintain its own website and have control of the public information. For clarity, the Party should not simply reference data published by a third-party (such as reports published on the UNFCCC website).

Ref Nr	Requirement	Submission complete	Has party identified this type of information confidential?	Comments
P1.4.2.2	13/CMP.1 Annex paragraph 46 (b) Project location; the Party and town or region in which the project is located	[]Yes [x]No	[]Yes [x]No []Partial	The Party refers to a website controlled by UNFCCC for this information. No information can be found on the website controlled by the Party. The Party should provide a reference to this information published on its own site(s).
				The Party informs in the [RESPONSE] document that the French DFP has no direct access to the registry's website (the Registry Administrator CDC is not part of the French administration), whereas the DFP can directly update the UNFCCC JI website. The Party has therefore decided, for the sake of simplicity, that all the relevant information on French JI projects will be displayed on the UNFCCC JI website.
				As stated in 44.2 in the SIAR Publicly Available Information Guidance v4.3 document, the Party should maintain its own website and have control of the public information. For clarity, the Party should not simply reference data published by a third-party (such as reports published on the UNFCCC website).

Ref Nr	Requirement	Submission complete	Has party identified this type of information confidential?	Comments
P1.4.2.3	13/CMP.1 Annex paragraph 46 (c) Years of ERU issuance; the years in which ERU's have been issued as a result of the Article 6 project	[]Yes [x]No	[]Yes [x]No []Partial	The Party refers to a website controlled by UNFCCC for this information. No information can be found on the website controlled by the Party. The Party should provide a reference to this information published on its own site(s).
				The Party informs in the [RESPONSE] document that the French DFP has no direct access to the registry's website (the Registry Administrator CDC is not part of the French administration), whereas the DFP can directly update the UNFCCC JI website. The Party has therefore decided, for the sake of simplicity, that all the relevant information on French JI projects will be displayed on the UNFCCC JI website.
				As stated in 44.2 in the SIAR Publicly Available Information Guidance v4.3 document, the Party should maintain its own website and have control of the public information. For clarity, the Party should not simply reference data published by a third-party (such as reports published on the UNFCCC website).

Ref Nr	Requirement	Submission complete	Has party identified this type of information confidential?	Comments
P1.4.2.4	13/CMP.1 Annex paragraph 46 (d) Reports; downloadable electronic version of all publicly available documentation relating to the project, including proposals, monitoring,	[]Yes [x]No	[]Yes [x]No []Partial	The Party refers to a website controlled by UNFCCC for this information. No information can be found on the website controlled by the Party. The Party should provide a reference to this information published on its own site(s).
	verification and issuance of ERU's, where relevant, subject to the confidentiality provisions in decision 9/CMP.1.			The Party informs in the [RESPONSE] document that the French DFP has no direct access to the registry's website (the Registry Administrator CDC is not part of the French administration), whereas the DFP can directly update the UNFCCC JI website. The Party has therefore decided, for the sake of simplicity, that all the relevant information on French JI projects will be displayed on the UNFCCC JI website.
				As stated in ID 44.2 in the SIAR Publicly Available Information Guidance v4.3 document, the Party should maintain its own website and have control of the public information. For clarity, the Party should not simply reference data published by a third-party (such as reports published on the UNFCCC website).
P1.4.3	13/CMP.1 Annex paragraph 47 Holding and transaction information provided?	[]Yes [x]No	[] Yes [] No [x] Partial	The Party has declared that parts of the information required under 13/CMP.1 Annex paragraph 47 (a) – (l) is confidential. The information of year X will be displayed from 15 January onwards of either year (X+1) or (X+5).

Ref Nr	Requirement	Submission complete	Has party identified this type of information confidential?	Comments
P1.4.3.1	13/CMP.1 Annex paragraph 47 (a) The total quantity of ERUs, CERs, AAUs and RMUs in each account at the beginning of the year	[]Yes [x]No	[x]Yes []No []Partial	The Party has declared this information to be confidential. Information on total quantities of ERUs, CERs, AAUs and RMUs in each account at the beginning of year X will be displayed from 15 January onwards of year (X+5).
				The Party reiterates in the [RESPONSE] document that pursuant to the European regulation 2216/2004/EC information in year X is confidential until 15 January onwards of year (X+5). The Party should provide content on their public website that declares the information required by 13/CMP.1 Annex paragraph 47(a) confidential until the appointed date.
P1.4.3.2	13/CMP.1 Annex paragraph 47 (b) The total quantity of AAUs issued on the basis of the assigned amount pursuant to Article 3, paragraphs 7 and 8	[x]Yes []No	[]Yes [x]No []Partial	The Party has declared that information on total quantity of AAUs issued in year X on the basis of the assigned amount pursuant to Article 3, paragraphs 7 and 8 will be displayed from 15 January onwards of year (X+1).
				A report with information on amount of AAUs issued (report no 8) can now be downloaded from the Public reports site
P1.4.3.3	13/CMP.1 Annex paragraph 47 (c) The total quantity of ERUs issued on the basis of Article 6 projects	[x]Yes []No	[] Yes [x] No [] Partial	The Party has declared that information on the total quantity of ERUs issued in year X on the basis of project activity implemented pursuant to Article 6 of the Kyoto Protocol will be displayed from 15 January onwards of year (X+1).
				A report with information on amount of ERUs issued (report no 8) can now be downloaded from the Public reports site.

Ref Nr	Requirement	Submission complete	Has party identified this type of information confidential?	Comments
P1.4.3.4	13/CMP.1 Annex paragraph 47 (d) The total quantity of ERUs, CERs, AAUs and RMUs acquired from other registries abd the identity of the transferring accounts and registries	[]Yes [x]No	[x]Yes []No []Partial	The Party has declared that information on the total quantity of ERUs, CERs, AAUs and RMUs acquired from other registries in year X and the identity of the transferring accounts and registries shall be displayed from 15 January onwards of year (X+5).
				The Party reiterates in the [RESPONSE] document that pursuant to the European regulation 2216/2004/EC information in year X is confidential until 15 January onwards of year (X+5). The Party should provide content on their public website that declares the information required by 13/CMP.1 Annex paragraph 47(d) confidential until the appointed date.
P1.4.3.5	13/CMP.1 Annex paragraph 47 (e) The total quantity of RMUs issued on the basis of each activity under Article 3, paragraphs 3 and 4	[]Yes [x]No	[]Yes [x]No []Partial	The Party has declared that information on the total quantity of RMUs issued in year X on the basis of each activity under Article 3, paragraphs 3 and 4 of the Kyoto Protocol will be displayed from 15 January onwards of year (X+1).
				The Party informs in the [RESPONSE] document that no RMU has been issued yet to the Party.
				Information on total quantity of RMUs issued is not available on the website of the Party. As stated in ID 44.9 in the SIAR Publicly Available Information Guidance (version 4.3) document, if data for a specific area does not exist because the underlying business event has not occurred, a note to reflect this should be presented on the website of the Party.

Ref Nr	Requirement	Submission complete	Has party identified this type of information confidential?	Comments
P1.4.3.6	13/CMP.1 Annex paragraph 47 (f) The total quantity of ERUs, CERs, AAUs and RMUs transferred to other registries and the identity of the acquiring accounts and registries	[]Yes [x]No	[x]Yes []No []Partial	The Party has declared that information on the total quantity of ERUs, CERs, AAUs and RMUs transferred to other registries in year X and the identity of the acquiring accounts and registries will be displayed from 15 January onwards of year (X+5).
				The Party reiterates in the [RESPONSE] document that pursuant to the European regulation 2216/2004/EC information in year X is confidential until 15 January onwards of year (X+5). The Party should provide content on their public website that declares the information required by 13/CMP.1 Annex paragraph 47(f) confidential until the appointed date.
P1.4.3.7	13/CMP.1 Annex paragraph 47 (g) The total quantity of ERUs, CERs, AAUs and RMUs cancelled on the basis of activities under Article 3, paragraphs 3 and 4	[]Yes [x]No	[]Yes [x]No []Partial	The Party has declared that information on the total quantity of ERUs, CERs, AAUs and RMUs cancelled in year X on the basis of activities under Article 3, paragraphs 3 and 4 of the Kyoto Protocol will be displayed from 15 January onwards of year (X+1).
				The Party informs in the [RESPONSE] document that compliance with article 3 paragraphs 3 and 4 of the Kyoto Protocol will be done at the end of the commitment period. Thus, no cancellation of units has been done for that purpose.
				Information on total quantity of units which have been cancelled is publicy available, but it is not specified on the Party's website if the cancellation has been done on the basis of activities under Article 3, paragraphs 3 and 4. As stated in ID 44.9 in the SIAR Publicly Available Information Guidance (version v4.3) document, if data for a specific area does not exist because the underlying business event has not occurred, a note to reflect this should be presented on the website of the Party.

Ref Nr	Requirement	Submission complete	Has party identified this type of information confidential?	Comments
P1.4.3.8	13/CMP.1 Annex paragraph 47 (h) The total quantity of ERUs, CERs, AAUs and RMUs cancelled following determination by the Compliance Committee that the Party is not in compliance with its commitment under Article 3, paragraph 1	[]Yes [x]No	[] Yes [x] No [] Partial	The Party has declared that information on the total quantity of ERUs, CERs, AAUs and RMUs cancelled in year X following determination by the compliance committee under the Kyoto Protocol that the Party is not in compliance with its commitment under Article 3, paragraph 1 of the Kyoto Protocol will be displayed from 15 January onwards of year (X+1).
				The Party informs in the [RESPONSE] document that the cancellations presented on the Party's website are related to the voluntary cancellation of Kyoto units that can be done by entities (article 62 of the regulation 2216/2004/EC). Those units are transferred into a specific cancellation account. Those transactions are not related to any decision from the Compliance Committee.
				Information on total quantity of units which have been cancelled is publicy available, but it is not specified on the website if the cancellation has been done following determination by the Compliance Committee. As stated in ID 44.9 in the SIAR Publicly Available Information Guidance (version v4.3) document, if data for a specific area does not exist because the underlying business event has not occurred, a note to reflect this should be presented on the website of the Party.

Ref Nr	Requirement	Submission complete	Has party identified this type of information confidential?	Comments
P1.4.3.9	13/CMP.1 Annex paragraph 47 (i) The total quantity of other ERUs, CERs, AAUs and RMUs cancelled	[]Yes [x]No	[] Yes [x] No [] Partial	The Party has declared that information on the total quantity of other ERUs, CERs, AAUs and RMUs, or allowances, cancelled in year X and the reference to the Article pursuant to which these Kyoto units or allowances were cancelled under EU Regulation will be displayed from 15 January onwards of year (X+1).
				Information on total quantity of units which have been cancelled is publicy available, but it is not specified the reason for cancellation of the units.
P1.4.3.10	13/CMP.1 Annex paragraph 47 (j) The total quantity of ERUs, CERs, AAUs and RMUs retired	[x]Yes []No	[]Yes [x]No []Partial	The Party has declared that information on the total quantity of ERUs, CERs, AAUs, RMUs and allowances retired in year X shall be displayed from 15 January onwards of year (X+1).
				A report with information on quantity of units retired (report no 8) can now be downloaded from the Public reports site.
P1.4.3.11	13/CMP.1 Annex paragraph 47 (k) The total quantity of ERUs, CERs and AAUs carried over from the previous commitment period	[]Yes [x]No	[]Yes [x]No []Partial	The Party has declared that information on the total quantity of ERUs, CERs, AAUs carried over in year X from the previous commitment period will be displayed from 15 January onwards of year (X+1).
				The Party informs in the [RESPONSE] document that carry over of units only takes place at the end of a commitment period, and therefore no information is available on the website.
				No information on the quantity of units carried over is available on the Party website. As stated in ID 44.9 in the SIAR Publicly Available Information Guidance (version v4.3) document, if data for a specific area does not exist because the underlying business event has not occurred, a note to reflect this should be presented on the website of the Party.

Ref Nr	Requirement	Submission complete	Has party identified this type of information confidential?	Comments
P1.4.3.12	13/CMP.1 Annex paragraph 47 (I) Current holdings of ERUs, CERs, AAUs and RMUs in each account	[]Yes [x]No	[x]Yes []No []Partial	The Party has declared that information on the current holdings of ERUs, CERs, AAUs and RMUs in each account (person holding, operator holding, Party holding, cancellation or retirement) on 31 December of year X will be displayed from 15 January onwards of year (X+5). The Party reiterates in the [RESPONSE] document that this information is confidential pursuant to EU regulation no 2216/2004/EC. The Party should provide content on their public website that declares the information required by 13/CMP.1 Annex paragraph 47(I) confidential until the appointed date.
P1.4.4	13/CMP.1 Annex paragraph 48 List of legal entities authorized by Party provided? ¹	[x]Yes []No	[]Yes [x]No	A report with a list of legal entities holding an account in the national registry (report no 1) can be downloaded from the Public reports site.

¹ For the purpose of the annual review, the list of accounts assigned to legal entities within the national registry is sufficient

5. Previous Expert Review Team recommendations

This section provides information on the completeness of Party's annual submission in addressing the previous annual review recommendations. If the Expert review team has made recommendations in the previous review, this section should list them and party's annual submission is checked if it covers each recommendation.

Ref Nr	Recommendation from previous Annual Review report (report FCCC/ARR/2009/FRA)	Has Party covered the recommendation in its submission?	Comment
P1.5.1	Paragraph 130: "The ERT noted from the SIAR that France should improve, in its next annual submission, it's reporting of registry related issues and that France has not made the required information referred to in paragraphs 46 and 47 of the annex to decision 13/CMP.1 publicly available. The ERT also noted that France had identified the public information pursuant to paragraphs 46 and 47 of the annex to decision 13/CMP.1 as confidential. The ERT reiterated the recommendation in the SIAR that France enhance the interface of its registry by providing the required information mentioned above, and any changes relating to public information, in its next submission in its next annual submission. The ERT also recommends that the Party make clear on its website which components of this information are confidential."	[]Yes [x]No	The Party should make a clear statement on its website which components of paragraphs 46 and 47 of the annex to decision 13/CMP.1 that are confidential, including those that are confidential by EU regulation for a defined time period.
P1.5.2	 Paragraph 131: "The ERT further recommends that France, in its next annual submission; (a) Report on changes to the consolidation of its national registry and the related cooperation arrangements, in accordance with paragraph 32(b) of the annex to decision 15/CMP.1; (b) Improve its reporting on changes to test results and test plans developed with the aim of testing the registry's performance and security procedures, in accordance with paragraph 32(j) of the annex to decision 15/CMP.1; 	[x]Yes []No	The information contained in [NIR-EN] covers these two recommendations.

P1.5.3	Paragraph 132: "The ERT noted the recommendation in the SIAR that France improve the annex to its NIR which relates to the national registry. During the centralized review, France informed the ERT that it intends to incorporate this annex into the main part of the NIR. The ERT welcomes this decision and recommends that France follow the annotated outline of the NIR provided by the UNFCCC secretariat in its next annual submission."	[x]Yes []No	
P1.5.4	Paragraph 133: "The ERT recommends that France improve the measures put in place in its registry with a view to minimizing operator error and ensuring efficient exchange of data with other registries and the ITL, in accordance with paragraphs 115(b) and 115(e) of the annex to decision 22/CMP.1."	[x]Yes []No	The Party has provided explanation in the [RESPONSE] document on how the recommendation has been addressed.
P1.5.5	 Paragraph 134: "The ERT recommends also that the following measures be put in place by the end of 2009 at the latest and that France report in its next annual submission on the changes made to its registry following the successful implementation and testing of these measures, including any relevant test plans and test reports: (a) Automated internal validations should be performed on account type codes before messages are submitted to the ITL; (b) Mitigation strategies should be implemented to minimise the reuse of recently used transaction unit blocks; (c) Automated internal validations should be performed to prevent users from proposing units involved in an inconsistency with the ITL; (d) A review by the Party of the design and implementation of France's registry should take place to prevent inconsistencies from occurring, in accordance with paragraph 25(e) of annex to decision 24/CP.8; (e) Measures to mitigate and reduce the internal fragmentation of unit blocks should be introduced; (f) Measures should be brought in to minimise user error with regard to voluntary cancellations. 	[x]Yes []No	The Party has provided explanation in the [RESPONSE] document on how the recommendations have been addressed.

P1.5.6 Paragraph 137: "The ERT recommends that France include a statement in its next NIR listing the changes in the national registry or, when no changes occur, state this explicitly in the NIR"	[x]Yes []No	The Party has stated that it uses version 4.3 and that it intends upgrade to version 5.0 in 2010.
--	--------------	---

Page 29 of 29