International Ad Hoc Working Group on Long-Term Cooperative Action: Comments on Ideas and Proposals on Paragraph 1 of the Bali Action Plan¹:

Issue/	Missing text to be included in the assembly document
paragraph	
SHARED VISION	
13	- The shared vision must be for a transformation of the global economy into one that is low carbon and sustainable
14	 The level of ambition must be based on the AR4 and more recent scientific data The agreement must be adequate to avoiding the threat of CC for all life on Earth
15	- The shared vision must express a vision for each of the building blocks of the Bali Action Plan, including a long-term science-based goal
16	 All relevant sectors must be included in the mitigation efforts, including international transport REDD must be demonstrably consistent with the 2C limit and the environmental integrity of the UNFCCC and the post 2012 agreement. REDD must be additional to deep domestic emission reductions by Annex I countries and must not create disincentives to the necessary transformation towards a future low carbon economy
17	 The perception of the crucial role that adaptation had to play in any serious action by the international community to deal with the challenge of climate change A focus on the most vulnerable people within countries, based on a process that adequately includes all marginalized socio-economic groups The crucial role that ecosystem based adaptation plays for safeguarding the provision of ecosystem goods and services Continuously reviewing new scientific results as a matter of precaution towards more severe consequences of climate change

¹ FCCC/AWGLCA/2008/16

 The shared vision must be for a post 2012 agreement that is adequate to avoiding the unprecedented threats of climate change for all life on Earth. It must be for an agreement that is comprehensive ambitious and equitable, and it must lay down the yardsticks against which the agreement is measured. The shared vision must lay out a vision for the transformation of the global economy into one that is low carbon and sustainable in its production and consumption, for all countries to achieve their developmen goals in a manner compatible with this goal. It must lay out markers for adaptation and the levels o technological, financial and capacity building support that will be required to achieve the overall level o ambition
 The fact that early and strong mitigation efforts reduce the negative impacts of climate change and the costs of adaptation should be a strong guardrail The recognition that climate change already causes unavoidable impacts and subsequent casualties and damages should be translated into adequate action
 The rapid development and deployment of low carbon and sustainable technologies is essential to achieving the vision of transforming the global economy into one that is compatible with the need to peak global emissions within the next ten years
 The level of financing for mitigation should be based on the precautionary principle, and be adequate to ensure global average temperature increases are kept as far below 2C as possible. The level of financing for adaptation should also be precautionary, reflecting the possibility that the 2C limit is exceeded
 Distribution of finance should be equitable, with criteria to ensure far distribution among countries CORRECTION: for 'using levies in the international aviation and maritime sectors' read 'using the proceeds of levies or of auctioning allowances in the international aviation and maritime sectors
 Global average temperatures must be kept as far below 2C as possible, consistent with the need to avoiding the unprecedented threats of climate change for all life on Earth
- Global emissions must peak within ten years
- Global emissions must be reduced by at least 80% by 2050, compared to 1990 levels

30	Developed countries should both take binding emissions reduction commitments at least at the upper end of the 25-40% below 1990 levels range and provide finance, technology and capacity building support to enable substantial deviation below baseline by developing countries. Financial support provided by developed countries to enable deviation below baseline by developing countries must be additional to, and not a substitute for, any use of flexible mechanisms by developed countries to meet their own quantified emissions reduction objectives. To preserve environmental integrity, mitigation actions by developed and developing countries must be genuinely additional and must not offset one another. Furthermore, in the interests of equity, any flexible mechanisms used in the post-2012 regime must be limited by quantitative and qualitative measures in order to preserve options for low-cost enhanced action on the part of developing countries.
31a	 CLARIFICATION ON CAN'S POSITION: Global temperature rise should be limited to AS FAR BELOW 2°C AS POSSIBLE and reduce temperatures from their peak as fast as possible
Additional paragraphs to be added to the end of the shared vision	 There should be a periodic review the agreed quantified emissions reduction objectives and nationally appropriate mitigation actions in the light of the best available scientific information and assessment on climate change and its impacts as well as relevant technical, social and economic information with a view to ensuring that the ultimate objective of the Convention and the shared vision are met. Based on these reviews, Parties should take appropriate action, including increasing the stringency of commitments, as necessary
Additional paragraphs to be added to the end of the shared vision	- The first review should be in 2014 and shall be based on the findings of the Fifth Assessment Report of the IPCC. Further reviews should take place at regular intervals
MITIGATION	
34	 Developed countries must adopt economy-wide quantified emission reduction commitments in commitment periods of 5 years
35	 <u>All</u> developed countries as a group must reduce their emissions from 1990 levels by at least the top end of 25-40% by 2020 and 80-95% by 2050 To ensure comparability and consistency the baseline for all commitments should be 1990 Efforts by developed countries should be comparable in relation to their capabilities and social and economic conditions. The establishment of key indicators for guidance in this regard would be helpful, to increase transparency and inspire trust

37	 Developed countries need to annually measure, report and verify the progress towards fulfilling their respective quantified emission reduction obligations, building upon existing modalities under the Kyoto Protocol. In addition, the support that they give to developing countries for capacity building, technology and finance must also be measured and verified against agreed criteria and reported annually
39 b)	 CLARIFICATION ON CAN's POSITION: Adopting economy-wide quantified emission reduction [in the submission, explicitly NOT limitation, as stated in the LCA document] commitments in developed countries in order to reduce emissions reductions from 1990 levels by at least the top end of 25-40% by 2020 and 80-95% by 2050. A large majority of the effort must be made domestically. Developed countries will need to provide adequate financial, technological and capacity building support to developing countries in order for them to achieve the necessary substantial deviation from BAU baseline. This support must be additional to any use of flexible mechanisms by developed countries to achieve their own emissions reduction targets
41	 Developing countries should adopt nationally appropriate mitigation actions, according to their respective responsibilities and capabilities, identifying actions in the following categories: "No regrets" options which can be implemented unilaterally enhanced action options, which will need to be supported by finance, technology and capacity building from developed countries; market mechanisms, without undermining the global mitigation ambition to keep global average temperature increases as far below 2C as possible and realizing deep domestic Annex I cuts

42	- Establishing, with international assistance, national measurement systems for groups or categories of
	actions, including criteria for categorization of pledged actions, to collect and collate data and
	information and report to the COP on progress against pledged actions
	- Improve availability of information about the range and impacts of actions that countries are taking to
	mitigate climate change. Principle: Revision of reporting structures (including national communications) should improve the information available on actions and the range of options for mitigation
	 Help countries clearly delineate actions they can take to meet GHG mitigation and development
	objectives. Principle: MRV should support developing countries in delineating actions that support
	mitigation and development objectives
	 Increase awareness among countries of options and best practices for effective mitigation. Principle: MRV should support best practice and capacity building
	 Enhancing the effectiveness of implementation of such actions at national and local levels, and the credibility of all countries' mitigation efforts. <i>Principle: MRV support the effective implementation of</i> actions
	 Hold developed countries accountable for meeting their commitments to support developing country actions. Principle: MRV ensure developed countries are accountable for their support obligations ad both actions and support should be verified
	 NAMAs should be reviewed internationally in a manner consistent with common but differentiated responsibilities
M	Why MRV is key:
	- MRV is a key policy design question central to the negotiation of an equitable and environmentally
	effective outcome. It should not be relegated to an operational issue that can be addressed after an agreement has been forged
	 Robust MRV mechanisms for both NAMAs in developing countries and technology, finance and capacity building support from developed countries will help build trust among parties. Such trust is essential to achieve agreement amongst Parties and ensure developed and developing countries take bold,
	ambitious, and creative actions that drive GHG reductions and promote sustainable development.
	- Some countries have already proposed principles for framing the MRV of technology, finance and
	capacity building support, but a fuller range of perspectives is needed, as well as an added focus on the MRV of NAMAs
	- ADDITIONAL TEXT: including criteria to determine whether pledged enhanced actions are genuinely
	measurable, reportable and verifiable
43	 Progress in the development of national mitigation action plans, including costing and categorization of actions

49	 The Conference of the Parties shall periodically review the agreed quantified emissions limitation and reduction objectives and nationally appropriate mitigation actions in the light of the best available scientific information and assessment on climate change and its impacts as well as relevant technical, social and economic information with a few to ensuring that the ultimate objective of the Convention and the shared vision are met. Based on these reviews, the Conference of the Parties shall take appropriate action, including increasing the stringency of commitments, as necessary. Parties should initiate negotiations as early as possible on future actions in the third commitment period, in time to ensure that there is no gap between commitment periods. The level of ambition of these negotiations should be guided and based on the findings of the Fifth Assessment Report of the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change as well as relevant technical, social and economic information
REDD	
51	 CAN believes that a mechanism to reduce emissions from deforestation must address the dual objectives of climate protection as well biodiversity protection as this will maximize environmental, social and economic benefits. Implementation of REDD should directly benefit local communities and Indigenous Peoples and not lead
	to displacement of local communities or Indigenous Peoples from their territories and lands.
52	 CAN believes that a national approach must be adopted in order to reduce transaction costs, address domestic leakage and ensure the integrity of baselines. A REDD mechanism must address emissions from both deforestation and forest degradation. The enhancement of forest carbon stocks would be more effectively dealt with via another mechanism.
	 REDD should not be a part of a project-based CDM.
53	 A voluntary, flexible, step-wise approach offers the highest potential for broad participation. Countries could adopt a stepwise approach as they acquire improved technical capacity, linked to positive incentives for increased capacity.
	 Any policy approach must provide incentives for countries with high deforestation emissions and those with currently low levels of deforestation but with vast amounts of forests that barring any alternatives, will likely be deforested. In addition, the provision of incentives to forested countries with current low deforestation will reduce the potential of international leakage from countries that reduce ongoing deforestation levels.
54	 Significant and reliable streams of funding for REDD are required. REDD must be additional to deep domestic emissions reductions by Annex I countries and must not create disincentives to the necessary transformation towards a future low carbon economy.

55	- The reduction of emissions from both deforestation and forest degradation.
	 In order to strengthen the robustness of REDD, methodologies to measure degradation need to be examined.
	 Addressing international leakage requires additional measures and mechanisms, particularly for countries that have historically low deforestation rates.
	 REDD methodologies must account for all significant sources of emissions from deforestation, including those from soils in peat land forests.
	 REDD rules need to account for all changes in carbon stocks with no exceptions e.g. emission from deforestation association with the establishment of timber plantations.
56	 Emissions from deforestation and degradation cannot be offset by any removals from other forest based activities.
	 REDD rules and modalities must protect the integrity of emission reduction commitments against the uncertainty associated with forest carbon fluxes and inventories.
57 k)	 Capacity building and support needs to be undertaken as a priority in establishing institutional structure to monitor, report and verify REDD activities.
58	 The UNFCCC should ensure that adequate guidance for the accounting and reporting of REDD activities is made available to Parties.
	 Countries with limited capacity to conduct an inventory of forest land could be supported through the building of capacity for the development of an inventory, including the necessary institutions and monitoring programs to maintain such an inventory.
Sectoral	
approaches	
65	- Cooperative sectoral approaches between countries should not include nuclear energy

I	
67 ADAPTATION	 Sectoral policies should be developed to tackle emissions from international aviation and shipping This action should complement, not replace, consideration under the AWG-KP, of how to include these emissions in National Totals of Annex I Parties. The AWG-LCA should ensure that sectoral approaches respect the principle of CBDR. Promising approaches to respecting CBDR include: Both sectors: global policies with 'compensation differentiation', ie revenues raised through auctioning of allowances or through levies used to support mitigation and adaptation work in developing countries. These could be combined with <i>de minimis</i> thresholds in order to protect the most vulnerable parties, for instance Small Island Developing States and Least Developed Countries, from possible spillover effects. Aviation: policies applied to all flights to and/or from Annex I Parties Shipping: policies applied to all ships on routes to Annex I Parties; policies applied to all emissions arising from imports of cargo to Annex I Parties. Policies applied only to ships flagged in Annex I Parties, or operated by companies registered in Annex I Parties, are neither equitable or effective and should be ruled out. AWG-LCA should set targets for these sectors, which should be in line with the efforts to limit global surface temperature rise to as far below 2 degrees centigrade as possible. International transport emissions should be included in targets to reduce global emissions by at least 80% from 1990 levels by 2050. AWG-LCA should instigate a program of work to determine a scientifically-robust multiplier for aviation emissions, so that if emissions from this sector rise under an overall target, compensating reductions in other sectors genuinely compensate for the full climate impact of increased aviation emissions.
94	Intelligent planning in a precautionary matter requires learning by doing, but is also crucial in face of the uncertainties entailed in mitigation policies as well in the earth system's behaviour; Both near- and longterm consequences of climate change are putting people at risk; therefore adaptation is both an urgent short term priority as well as a longterm necessity. Existing experience, e.g. gained through the development and implementation of National Adaptation Programmes of Action, serves as an important starting point for longer-term adaptation; Human rights commitments should provide guidance for adaptation planning and implementation that ensures the accountability of governments towards their citizens; Adaptation measures should be designed in a way that they effectively contribute to poverty reduction and sustainable development strategies as well as to low carbon development pathways;

 Decision-making on the planning and implementation of adaptation activities at all levels should be inclusive, participatory and transparent;
 Adaptation planning and implementation should entail and be based on the transparent identification of the most vulnerable people, recognising the dynamic influence of factors like human mobility, and the most vulnerable and vulnerable ecosystems and prioritize increasing adaptive capacity, including through empowering vulnerable communities to identify their own needs and the solutions necessary.
 The extensive and increasing body of experience in community-based adaptation which should serve as a key foundation for expanding the implementation of adaptation;
- The extensive and increasing body of experience in community-based adaptation, including risk management, should serve as a key foundation for expanding the implementation of adaptation activities;
 The integration of community based adaptation with ecosystem adaptation is essential, because vulnerable people often depend on their natural environments to provide them with essential services that become even more critical in the face of climate change;
- Responsibility for adaptation lies mainly with national and local governments. They should have the policy space to decide the appropriate role of the private sector in delivering adaptation;
 There is a need to clarify and develop a normative framework to address migration and displacement related to climate change and identify necessary research, legal, operational and capacity building activities;
 Severe impacts of climate change that go beyond the adaptive capacities of communities and countries may require extreme forms of responses, such as migration and displacement; Institutions in countries that are sources and receivers of climate-related migrants and displaced persons should work together to facilitate adaptation rather than mal-adaptation;
 Adaptation under the uncertainties of a changing climate requires a learning-by-doing approach. Uncertainties should not be taken as reason for delay in implementing adaptation.

95	 Developing long-term adaptation strategies must provide for regular review and updating in order to adapt adaptation strategies to the changing climatic circumstances; "stand alone" projects can be a necessary and useful complement to the integration of adaptation in development planning and to the development of long-term adaptation strategies; the implementation of adaptation plans should be measurable, reportable and verifiable with regard to envisaged results: Adaptation plans should include trans-boundary adaptation activities where appropriate; Adaptation plans and implementation should be made transparent to local communities, and funded projects, programs and activities should ensure the engagement and participation of local communities and be subject to accountability by local communities.
97	 Vulnerability and adaptation assessments should not be limited to analyses of biophysical risks, but be combined with analyses of economic, social and political determinants of adaptive capacity. Vulnerability and adaptation assessments should be inclusive, participatory and transparent. They should empower vulnerable communities to identify their own needs and the solutions necessary to increase their adaptive capacity Vulnerability mapping is an important tool to guide effective adaptation planning and policies, in particular with regard to identifying people most vulnerable to the adverse effects of climate change;
	 Existing evidence and experience from Disaster Risk Reduction activities, in particular participatory, community-based approaches to empower communities, as well as analyses of ecosystem vulnerability, can inform climate change vulnerability assessments Nationally determined assessments of adaptation measures should include indigenous, traditional and community based knowledge and endogenous adaptation technologies and ecosystem based strategies
98	 Concrete suggestions should be made on the kind of measures needed to incentivize Parties to adequately plan and implement adaptation activities, and how these would support the creation of enabling environments Action taken need to take into account that adaptation, particularly in the most vulnerable countries, will largely remain a public responsibility with limited scope for the private sector, and that creation of enabling environments must not lead to a limitation of the policy space of local or national governments', in particular with regard to prioritising policy actions to address the need of the poor and vulnerable

99	 The level of financial and technical support for adaptation in developing countries should be scaled-up by three order of magnitude in order to meet needs
	 The scale of adaptation necessary and the levels of funding this will require has a direct and inverse relationship with the level of mitigation achieved. This must be reflected in the future adaptation financing mechanism
	 Adaptation planning and implementation should take a precautionary approach when defining the level and type of adaptation needed and be continuously reviewed and adjusted to reflect current and projected changes in the local climate
	 Mechanisms to enhance the transfer, deployment and diffusion of adaptation technologies should ensure access to appropriate technologies that are designed to meet the needs of different social groups and local contexts
	 Adaptation planning and implementation should ensure appropriate and accessible technologies for different social groups and local settings
	 Financial support for adaptation should be additional to existing ODA commitments (0.7% GNI), come in the form of grants not loans and must be sufficient to meet the full additional costs of adaptation in developing countries
100	 Measures and strategies that prioritise adaptation of marginalised or disadvantaged groups, paying special attention to women as a particularly vulnerable group who can play an important role as agents of change in implementing adaptation
	 Actions that integrate adaptation and risk reduction targeted at the most vulnerable people with ecosystem adaptation, recognising the key role ecosystems can play for building resilience and reducing poverty for vulnerable people, particularly women
	- Facilitating and expanding Community based adaptation
	- Disaster risk reduction and prevention activities to make livelihoods more robust, both for long-term and short term risks, building resilient livelihoods
	 An international insurance mechanism which assists developing countries particularly vulnerable to climate change in coping with the adverse effects of extreme weather events and in reducing risks from climate events
	 Measures of extreme forms of response, including migration and displacement, where adaptive capacity of ecosystems or societies has been exceeded
	 Actions and programmes on large-scale regional adaptation, including urgent emergency measures, undertaken co-operatively by several countries in a region
	 Financing adaptation should be supported by innovative and new international mechanism to ensure predictable financing, according to the principles laid out in inter alia the UNFCCC and the Bali Action Plan

101	- Measures to identify technologies available in the public domain and facilitate their uptake and diffusion in developing countries
	 Measures to enhance the transfer, uptake and diffusion of technologies by overcoming intellectual property-rights (IPR) barriers for technologies where developing countries have identified these to be preventing the uptake of technologies for adaptation
102	- Knowledge can also be transferred from developing countries to industrialized countries
103 c)	 Measures should strengthen and enhance the use of indigenous and traditional knowledge for adaptation technologies and promote exchange of such knowledge and technologies.
106	 Adaptation in the Copenhagen agreement should be covered by a comprehensive Framework for Adaptation consisting of an adaptation and prevention pillar and an insurance pillar, both funded through an adaptation finance mechanism;
	 A multi-stakeholder advisory group would be a useful institutional arrangement in order to give strategic advice to the negotiations and implementation related to adaptation;
	 A consolidated work program on adaptation should be developed on the basis of nationally determined assessments of the impacts, vulnerabilities and cost of adaptation for developing countries, particularly from LDC, SIDS and African countries affected by extreme weather events, with a view to increase the readiness of Parties to scale-up the implementation of adaptation;
	- Institutions in countries that are sources and receivers of climate-related migrants should work together;
110	 A consolidated work program on adaptation should be developed on the basis of nationally determined assessments of the impacts, vulnerabilities and cost of adaptation for developing countries, particularly from LDC, SIDS and African countries affected by extreme weather events, with a view to increase the readiness of Parties to scale-up the implementation of adaptation;
TECHNOLOGY	
	Machaniana ta anhanza tha transfor, darla mant and diffusion of adaptation tachnalagies abould
122	 Mechanisms to enhance the transfer, deployment and diffusion of adaptation technologies should promote access to appropriate technologies that is designed to meet the needs of different social groups and local contexts Adaptation planning and implementation should onsure appropriate and accessible technologies for
	 Adaptation planning and implementation should ensure appropriate and accessible technologies for different social groups and local settings
	 Measures should strengthen and enhance the use of indigenous and traditional knowledge for adaptation technologies and promote exchange of such knowledge and technologies

124	 A mechanism should be established to provide a clear framework for evaluating when patents and related intellectual property rights become a barrier to radically increased technology cooperation and sharing. It should provide options for corrective action, that both ensure that appropriate protection is provided to maintain incentives for innovation, while ensuring enhanced sharing and follow-on innovation, guided by the imperative of achieving the UNFCCC's mitigation and adaptation goals
126	 Energy related R&D should be at least doubled, as recommended by GLOBE and Stern. There should also be a massive increase in technology demonstration resources Eliminate all use of export credits and assistance funds, including funding from the multilateral development banks, which support the development of energy supplies based on fossil fuels
127	 Fossil and nuclear subsidies should be phased out in order to create a more technology neutral baseline for the energy transition needed towards a low carbon economy
132	 Removal of trade barriers in the rich countries to sustainable technologies, which reduce greenhouse gas emissions and the establishment of trade policies and public procurement policies in order to stimulate the rapid diffusion of these technologies Capacity building to respect, strengthen and disseminate the use of indigenous and traditional knowledge and technologies in adaptation
137	 Minimum standards must be implemented for energy efficiency of all energy-consuming equipment and technologies, for example aircraft, ships, cars and household appliances, in the developed countries Future technology efforts should be organized in a set of Technology Action Programs, each of five years' duration and each with clear targets. Up to twenty programs should be developed for critical adaptation and mitigation technologies, including solar and wind energy, early warning systems, energy savings in buildings and industrial sectors and pro-poor technologies to avid salinity intrusion, as well as a phase out of HFCs
139	 Nuclear power should not receive any support as part of measurable, reportable and verifiable finance
FINANCE	
147 a)iv	 The level of financing provided for mitigation should be based on the precautionary principle and keeping global warming as far below two degrees as possible; the finance must be deployed in a way that is consistent with respect for human rights, including environmental, labour and indigenous rights
147 c)x	- contribute to a transition to a carbon neutral economy through sustainable low carbon development
157 o)	 Provision of financing should respect sovereignty, transparency and national priorities, informed by technology needs assessments and adaptation plans of national governments, produced with the participation of civil society and parliamentary oversight and regularly reviewed

158 h)	 Resources must ensure readiness and capacity building for adaptation in order to make absorption of appropriate technologies possible
167	 Funding for adaptation should emphasize the needs of particularly vulnerable populations, especially women Funding should be made transparent to local communities, and funded projects, programs and activities should ensure the engagement and participation of local communities and be subject to accountability by local communities
COMPLIANCE	
	 All legally binding obligations should be subject to a compliance system that is compulsory and backed by legally binding consequences tailored to the nature of obligations The compliance system should be no less robust than the Kyoto Protocol system, and should improve on the Kyoto Protocol by: increasing the role of the Public, consistent with the principles of the Aarhus Convention, including: Access to information at all stages Opportunities, both directly and electronically, to participate in proceedings