

SUBSIDIARY BODY FOR SCIENTIFIC AND TECHNOLOGICAL ADVICE

Twelfth session

Bonn, 12-16 June 2000

Agenda item 5

SUBSIDIARY BODY FOR IMPLEMENTATION

Twelfth session

Bonn, 12-16 June 2000

Agenda item 5

**PROCEDURES AND MECHANISMS RELATING TO COMPLIANCE
UNDER THE KYOTO PROTOCOL**

**Report of the Joint Working Group on Compliance on its work during
the twelfth sessions of the subsidiary bodies**

Proposals from the co-Chairmen of the Joint Working Group on Compliance

I. INTRODUCTION

1. The meetings of the Joint Working Group on Compliance (JWG) were presided over by Mr. Tuiloma Neroni Slade and Mr. Harald Dovland.
2. The co-Chairman of the JWG, Mr. Harald Dovland, opened the meetings of the JWG on 13 June. He recalled that Parties had held extensive discussions during the inter-sessional period on the development of a compliance system. A workshop was held from 1 to 3 March 2000 where Parties expressed their views on a compliance system. Based on these discussions, the co-Chairmen prepared a set of elements for the development of a compliance system under the Kyoto Protocol. These elements are contained in document FCCC/SB/2000/1, which served as the basis for discussions at the meetings of the JWG.
3. It was noted that the discussion during the week of informal meetings had been fruitful. The co-Chairmen prepared a paper for discussion by the JWG based on preliminary reactions and further proposals by Parties.

II. PROCEDURES AND MECHANISMS RELATING TO COMPLIANCE UNDER THE KYOTO PROTOCOL

A. Proceedings

4. The JWG held discussions on the development of procedures and mechanisms relating to a compliance system under the Kyoto Protocol. Statements were made by representatives of 20 Parties, including one speaking on behalf of the Group of 77 and China, one speaking on behalf of the European Community and its member States and one speaking on behalf of the Alliance of Small Island States

B. Conclusions

5. On the basis of a proposal by the co-Chairmen, the JWG requested the co-Chairmen, with the assistance of the secretariat, to further develop the text on compliance contained in the annex to this report to serve as the basis for negotiation, along with inputs from Parties, at the thirteenth sessions of the subsidiary bodies.

III. CLOSURE OF THE MEETINGS

6. At its 4th meeting, on 15 June 2000, the co-Chairmen presented the draft report of the JWG. The JWG considered and adopted its report.

Annex

**[PROCEDURES AND MECHANISMS RELATED
TO COMPLIANCE UNDER THE KYOTO PROTOCOL]**

[A COMPLIANCE SYSTEM FOR THE KYOTO PROTOCOL]

Section I. General provisions

Objective

Option 1

The objective of the [procedures and mechanisms related to compliance] [compliance system] [following provisions] is to facilitate, promote and enforce compliance by each Party with its [commitments] [obligations] [contained] in [and under] the Protocol, in particular the [commitment] [obligation] under [Articles 2 and 3] [Article 3.1] [Article 4.1] of the Protocol, [and, as appropriate, the rules, guidelines and procedures thereunder.]

Option 2

The objective of the [procedures and mechanisms related to compliance] [compliance system] [following provisions] is to facilitate, promote and enforce compliance with the Protocol.

Option 3

The objective of the [procedures and mechanisms related to compliance] [compliance system] [following provisions] is to facilitate and promote achievement of the ultimate objective of the Convention.

Nature

Option 1

The [procedures and mechanisms related to compliance] [compliance system] shall be credible, [fair], coherent, comprehensive, unified, effective, predictable, transparent and simple.

Option 2

The nature of the [procedures and mechanisms related to compliance] [compliance system] should not be expressly provided for in the operative text, as its nature will be implicit from the content of the text. Alternatively, its nature could be reflected in the preamble or in a decision accompanying the adoption of the [procedures and mechanisms related to compliance] [compliance system].

Principles

Option 1

The operation of the [procedures and mechanisms related to compliance] [compliance system] shall [be guided by] [be based on] the [principles set out in Article 3 of the Convention] [and the recognized principles under international law.] [and in particular shall]:

[1. Be proportionate, in that the procedures, mechanisms and consequences should take into account the cause, type, degree and frequency of non-compliance;]

[2. Adhere to the principle of common but differentiated responsibilities as defined in the Convention;]

[3. Treat all Parties that have undertaken the same [commitments] [obligations] in an equivalent manner;]

[4. Be based on principles of efficiency and due process allowing Parties, and in particular the Party concerned, an opportunity for a full, fair and timely [consideration and] resolution of compliance-related issues; [, including the presumption that a Party has complied with its commitments unless non-compliance is established.]]

[5. Preserve sovereign rights of Parties;]

[6. Provide for reasonable certainty; prevention of non-compliance; importance of domestic compliance and enforcement; creating appropriate incentives to comply; restoration to the environment of excess tonnes; automaticity; and transparency.]

Option 2

Principles governing the operation of the [procedures and mechanisms related to compliance] [compliance system] should not be expressly provided for in the text, as they are contained in the Convention and the Protocol and could be implicit from the content of the text, or be reflected in the preamble or in a decision accompanying the adoption of the [procedures and mechanisms related to compliance] [compliance system].

Scope of application

Option 1

The [procedures and mechanisms related to compliance] [compliance system] shall apply to all [commitments] [obligations] [contained] in [and under] the Protocol.

Option 2

The [procedures and mechanisms related to compliance] [compliance system] shall apply to all [commitments] [obligations] [contained] in [and under] the Protocol [as provided in this decision.] [, except where otherwise provided.]

Option 3

The [procedures and mechanisms related to compliance] [compliance system] shall apply to all [commitments] [obligations] [contained] in [and under] the Protocol, [and as appropriate, the rules, guidelines, and procedures thereunder [, except that all compliance and non-compliance issues with respect to the clean development mechanism (CDM) shall be dealt with exclusively by the executive board of the CDM]].

Option 4

The [procedures and mechanisms related to compliance] [compliance system] shall apply to [Articles 3.1, 4.1, 5, 7, 8, 6, 12, 17] [all [commitments]] [obligations] of Annex I Parties [contained] in [and under] the Protocol. All issues of compliance with other [commitments] [obligations] [contained] in [and under] the Protocol shall be addressed and determined by the multilateral consultative process established pursuant to Article 16.

Functions

The [procedures and mechanisms related to compliance] [compliance system] shall [complement] [be supplemental to] the other compliance-related provisions of the Protocol. [They] [It] shall perform the following [general] functions:

- [1. [Decide] [Advise] which questions [regarding implementation submitted to it] shall be pursued [in accordance with agreed criteria];
2. Provide [for] advice and [facilitate] assistance to the Party concerned regarding its implementation of the Protocol;
- [3. Determine questions raised related to application of any adjustment under Article 5.2;]
- [4. Address specific questions arising under Articles [4], 6, [12] and [, if provided for by an amendment to the Protocol, Article] 17, including any questions in respect of Article 6.4;]
- [5. Address [an allegation] that a Party is failing to meet the eligibility requirements contained in and under Articles 6, [12] and [, if provided for by an amendment to the Protocol, Article] 17;]
6. Address questions of [alleged] [non-compliance] [compliance] by [individual][Annex I] Parties [, and specific questions under Article 3.14]; and [determine] [make a recommendation as to] whether or not a Party is in compliance with Article [3.1] [Articles 2 and 3] [Article 4.1] [, through the subsidiary body on compliance to the COP/MOP];
7. [Determine] [Recommend] [and/or apply] appropriate outcomes or consequences [; and/or in the case of a mandatory outcome or consequence [concerning an Annex I Party], apply [it] [them] as set forth in paragraph ...]

[Recommend appropriate outcomes in accordance with section IV, paragraph 1, and apply appropriate consequences in accordance with section IV, paragraphs 2, 3 and 4.]

Section II. Establishment and structure

Establishment

Option 1

1. The [compliance body]¹ is hereby established. [, as a subsidiary body pursuant to Article 13.4 [(h)] [j] of the Protocol.] [under Article 18.]
- [2. The [compliance body] may establish such sub-groups or panels as it deems necessary to carry out its functions.]

Option 2

1. The [compliance body] is hereby established. [, as a subsidiary body pursuant to Article 13.4 [(h)] [j] of the Protocol.] [under Article 18.]
2. The [compliance body] shall consist of two branches, to be designated as branch 1 and branch 2. [, dealing with facilitation and enforcement, respectively.]²

(a) Mandate of branch 1

Branch 1 shall provide [for] advice and [facilitate] assistance to individual Parties. [, and otherwise [decide] [make recommendations on] questions of implementation whose treatment may potentially lead to outcomes of [a non-mandatory] [facilitative] nature, set out in paragraph . . .]

(b) Mandate of branch 2

[Branch 2 shall [decide] [advise] on questions of implementation [of Annex I Parties] that warrant treatment of a more judicial nature and that can potentially lead to [pre-agreed] outcomes of [a mandatory] [enforcement] nature, as set out in paragraph... It shall address:]

[The role of branch 2 shall be limited to assessing:]

- (i) Non-compliance with [Articles 2 and 3] [Article 3.1] of the Protocol;

¹ The formal title of the compliance body, whether compliance institution, compliance authority, compliance committee, compliance system, procedures and mechanisms related to compliance, or other, is yet to be decided.

² The formal titles of the branches, whether facilitative branch or consultative branch, enforcement branch or compliance branch, are yet to be decided.

- (ii) The [alleged] failure [by Annex I Parties] to meet the eligibility requirements for one or more of the mechanisms under Articles 6, [12] [, if provided for by an amendment to the Protocol, Article] 17 [, including determining that a suspended Party may resume use of one or more such mechanisms];
- [(iii) Non-compliance with Articles 5 and 7];
- (iv) The application of adjustments under Article 5.2 [, in the event of a dispute];
- [(v) Failure to achieve the emission level under Article 4];
- [(vi) Failure to implement Article 3.14].

Structure³

1. The [compliance body] [branch 1] [branch 2] shall consist of [no more than][...] [10] [12] [15] [21] [20] [25] [30] members [to be assisted by a roster of experts]. It shall be composed of experts of recognized competence in relevant fields, such as the scientific, technical, socio-economic and legal fields. [The [compliance body] may draw upon such other expertise as it deems necessary.]

2. The members of the [compliance body] [branch 1] [branch 2] shall be [nominated by Parties and shall act in their personal capacity] [representatives of Parties]. The [election] of members shall be based on [equal representation of the five UN regional groups] [one half to be elected from among Annex I Parties and one half to be [elected] from among non-Annex I Parties] [a larger proportional representation from among Annex I Parties] [within the group of Annex I and non-Annex I Parties representation shall be based on equitable geographic representation].

3. The members of the [compliance body] shall be [elected] by the Conference of the Parties serving as the meeting of the Parties to the Protocol (COP/MOP) for [2] [3] [4] years. The COP/MOP shall [elect] [...] members for a term of [two] years and [...] members for a term of [...] years. At two year intervals thereafter, the COP/MOP shall alternately [elect] [...] new members for a term of [...] years. Outgoing members may be [re-elected] for one consecutive term.

Section III. Procedures

[Referral] [Submission] of questions to the [compliance body]

Option 1

1. Questions regarding the implementation of the Protocol may be submitted to the

³ The composition and expertise of each branch will depend on the determination of options under section II, "Establishment".

[compliance body], [through the secretariat,] with corroborating information :

- [(a) In reports of the expert review teams under Article 8] [In questions identified in accordance with relevant provisions under Article 8];
- (b) By any Party with respect to implementation of its own [commitments] [obligations];
- [(c) By any Party with respect to the implementation of another Party's [commitments] [obligations] [only with respect to branch 1];
- [(d) By the COP/MOP [, except that a Party may not participate in the decision with respect to a question directly concerning itself];
- [(e) By a body of representatives established by the COP/MOP];
- [(f) By the executive board or other bodies established under Articles 6, 12 or 17.]
- [(g) By the secretariat].

[2. The secretariat shall receive the reports of the expert review teams under Article 8; and shall transmit [any question regarding implementation identified in the report] [all the reports] to the [compliance body].]

Option 2

[The following are questions of implementation that can be submitted to the [compliance body] [branch 1 or branch 2]]:

- [1. Questions of implementation indicated in reports prepared by expert review teams as listed by the secretariat];
- [2. Questions raised by a Party concerning the implementation of its obligations under the Protocol];
- [3. Questions raised by a Party or Parties concerning the implementation of the obligations of another Party under the Protocol].

Preliminary examination of questions

[1. The [compliance body] [chairperson of the [compliance body]] [chairpersons of branches 1 and 2] [screening panel] [screening panel set up by the COP/MOP, with equal representation of the five UN regional groups] shall forward the question submitted under paragraphs... to the relevant branch in accordance with the mandate of that branch.] [, where multiple questions submitted raise the same type of issues (e.g. specific methodologies, interpretation of the same provisions of the Protocol) the matter [may][shall] be referred to the SBI or the SBSTA.]

3. The [compliance body] [relevant branch] [screening panel] [screening panel set up by the COP/MOP, with equal representation of the five UN regional groups] shall make a preliminary examination of questions submitted to it, other than those raised by a Party concerning itself [, to ensure that the questions are supported by sufficient information], [in accordance with agreed criteria [established] [adopted] by the [compliance body]

[COP/MOP]] and [are otherwise not *de minimis* or ill-founded questions].

[3. Preliminary examination of questions shall be completed within [...] weeks after receiving [a question of implementation].]

[4. Following this preliminary examination, [branch 2] may forward a question within its mandate to [branch 1] for consideration on how to address that question. If the matter at issue has not been resolved within [x] weeks, [branch 1] shall return that question to [branch 2] for its determination.]

Proceedings [of the compliance body]

1. Decision-making

Option 1

The members of [the compliance body] [branch 1] [branch 2] shall make every effort to reach agreement on its [decisions] [recommendations] by consensus. If all efforts at consensus have been exhausted, and no agreement reached, the decision shall as a last resort be adopted by a [three-quarters majority] vote of [the Parties] [members] present and voting at the meeting.

Option 2

The [compliance body] [branch 1] [branch 2] shall make its [decision] [recommendation] [by consensus] [by [...] majority of the members of the [compliance body]][branch1][branch 2] present and voting] [by double majority of the members from Annex I Parties and the members from non-Annex I Parties] [according to the rules of the COP/MOP].

2. Participation of Parties⁴

The Party [in question] [concerned] shall be entitled to [nominate a] [designate one or more] person [s] to represent it during the consideration of its case by [the compliance body] [branch 1] [branch 2], [and shall have the right through its representative to call, require the attendance of, and question witnesses.] The Party [in question] [concerned] shall [be given the opportunity] [be entitled] to comment on [any information used by the [compliance body] [branch 1] [branch 2] as a basis for its deliberation and on] the draft conclusions and recommendations of [the compliance body] [branch 1] [branch 2] but shall not take part in the drafting and adoption of its [decisions] [recommendation] on that matter.]

3. Avoidance of conflict of interest

No member of [the compliance body] [branch 1] [branch 2] who is a national of a Party that is involved in a matter before the [compliance body] shall take part in the

⁴ The participation of Parties may be different, and may need to be provided for, in respect of the operation of branch 1 and branch 2.

[consideration,] drafting and adoption of any decision [on that matter] [in which they have a direct or indirect interest].

4. Sources of information

Option 1

- (a) The [compliance body] may seek information from the following sources:
- (i) Reports by expert review teams under Article 8 of the Protocol;
 - (ii) Information provided by Parties concerned;
 - [(iii) Other [experts,] and [non-governmental] organizations [with relevant and specified knowledge and expertise related to the Protocol and the Convention]; and
 - [(iv) Any other source that it considers to be appropriate.]

[(b) The [compliance body] shall ensure the confidentiality of [any information that it has received in confidence].]

Option 2

- (a) The [compliance body] shall base its deliberations on:
- (i) Reports by expert review teams under Article 8 of the Protocol;
 - (ii) Information provided by Parties concerned;
 - (iii) Relevant reports of the COP/MOP and its subsidiary bodies.

(b) The [compliance body] may [seek] [receive] additional information from:

- [(i) Other experts and organizations [, as appropriate];] and
- [(ii) Any other source that it considers to be appropriate.]

(c) The [compliance body] shall ensure the confidentiality of [any information that it has received in confidence].]

5. [The COP/MOP shall develop] [[This decision shall set] detailed rules for the operation of the [compliance body] [branch 1] [branch 2], including additional rules related to other procedural matters, as well as proceedings for appeal set out in paragraph

6. Other procedural arrangements

Option 1

Procedural arrangements related to [facilitation] [branch 1] and [enforcement] [branch 2] are contained in annexes I and II. An expedited procedure related to cases under Articles 6, 12 and 17 is contained in annex III.

Option 2

- (a) Procedural arrangements related to [only] [facilitation] [branch 1]

The provisions now contained in annex I might be set out here, with necessary modifications.

- (b) Procedural arrangements related to [enforcement] [branch 2]

The provisions now contained in annex II might be set out here, with necessary modifications

- [(c) Expedited procedure with respect to questions under Articles 6, 12 and 17.

The provisions now contained in annex III might be set out here, with necessary modifications. This procedure might be dealt by branch 2.

Appeal

Option 1

1. An appeal [procedure] shall be available for [all] decisions involving outcomes or consequences of [a mandatory] [enforcement] nature [relating to non-compliance with Article 3.1].

2. The appeal [procedure] shall be [decided][carried out] by [a [standing] [ad hoc] appellate body] [the COP/MOP]. [The COP/MOP may agree by consensus to override the decision on appeal.] [The Party whose compliance or non-compliance is under consideration may not participate in any decision on appeal directly concerning that Party.]

Option 2

There should be no procedure for appeal.

COP/MOP

1. The [compliance body] shall report [through the secretariat] on its [advisory] activities [and judicial work] to each ordinary session of the COP/MOP;

2. The COP/MOP shall consider [decisions] [reports] [and conclusions] of the [compliance body], [including any issues regarding implementation [as well as trends of problems] that may have implications for the work of the subsidiary bodies];

[3. The COP/MOP [shall] [may] [accept] [take note of] [receive] [modify] [or reject] the [reports] [decisions] of the [compliance body], [unless the COP/MOP decides by consensus not to do so.] [, , except that a Party that is a subject of appeal may not vote on appeal.]

[4. The COP/MOP shall provide general policy guidance [or background] to the [compliance body].]

True-up period

1. [...] [one] month[s] shall be allowed after [the end of the commitment period] [the publication of the final report of the expert review of the inventory of the last Party to be reviewed for the last year of the commitment period], [other], to be known as the true-up period.

2. During the true-up period, in order to fulfil its commitments under Article 3.1, any Party may:

(a) [Acquire [and transfer] parts of assigned amount from the commitment period in question];

(b) [Continue to utilize Articles 6, [12] and [, if provided for by an amendment to the Protocol, Article] 17 (provided it has not been found ineligible to participate in any mechanism under those Articles)];

(c) [Make a voluntary payment into a climate change fund(s)].

Section IV. Outcomes and consequences [of non-compliance or potential non-compliance, taking into account the implications of Article 18]

1. The [compliance body] [branch 1] may, depending upon the particular case before it, [decide] [make recommendations] upon one or more [of the following [outcomes and] [facilitative] consequences:

(a) Provision [of] [for] advice and [facilitating] assistance to individual Parties regarding implementation of the Protocol;

(b) [Facilitation of financial and technical assistance, including technology transfer and capacity-building, to [non-Annex I] Parties;]

- (c) [Making recommendations];
- (d) Publication of non-compliance or potential non-compliance;
- (e) Issuing of cautions;
- [(f) Initiation of the enforcement procedure set out in annex II]

[[Mandatory] [consequences] shall not be applied to non-Annex I Parties]

2. [The [compliance body] [branch 2] shall apply adjustments, where necessary.]

3. The [compliance body] [branch 2], in the case where it has [determined] [established] that [a Party] [an Annex I Party] has failed to meet certain eligibility requirements related to the mechanisms under Articles 6, [12] and [, if provided for by an amendment to the Protocol Article] 17, shall [make a recommendation regarding] [suspend] the [Annex I] Party's eligibility for the mechanisms in question, in accordance with the provisions in or under Articles 6, [12] and/or [, if provided for by an amendment for the Protocol, Article] 17, as applicable.]

Or

[If an [Annex I] Party is found by the [compliance body] [branch 2] to be in breach of any of the eligibility requirements under Articles 6, [12] [and] [or] [, if provided for by an amendment to the Protocol, Article] 17, [that Party] [and other members of that Party's Article 4 arrangement] may not:

- (a) [Transfer or] acquire parts of assigned amount; [or]
- (b) [Transfer or] acquire emission reduction units; [or]
- (c) Acquire certified emission reductions;

in accordance with the provisions of Article 3, until the [compliance body] is satisfied that the Party is in full compliance with the relevant requirements.]

4. If [the compliance body] [branch 2] [appellate body] determines that a Party, following the true-up period, has not complied with [Article 3] [Article 3.1] [Article 4.1] of the Protocol, it shall [apply] [request the Party to choose] [one of] the following consequences [, or a combination thereof] [,taking into account the cause, type, degree and frequency of such non-compliance] [unless the Party can demonstrate to the satisfaction of the [compliance body] that the cause, type, degree or frequency of its non-compliance makes it inappropriate to do so]:

- [(a). *Publication of non-compliance*

The [compliance body] [branch 2] shall notify [through...] all Parties to the Protocol of the details of the Party's non-compliance; and publish its determination, including the reasons for it on the UNFCCC web site.]

[(b). Recommendation of policies and measures

Recommend policies and measures [, taking into account Article 2.3 of the Protocol] [with the aim..].]

[(c) Restoration of excess [tonnes]

Option 1

Determine that [1.3] [1.x] [x] times the [number of] excess tonnes shall be deducted from the Party's assigned amount for the commitment period following the period for which the non-compliance with Article 3.1 occurred.]

Option 2

[Purchase units of assigned amount originating in the first commitment period and apply them towards meeting their Article 3.1 [commitments] [obligations] at a penalty rate of 1.x; or

Purchase units of assigned amount originating in the second commitment period and apply them to meeting their Article 3.1 [commitments] [obligations] at a penalty rate of 1.y; or

Purchase a combination of units of assigned amount originating in both the first and second commitment periods and apply them toward meeting their Article 3.1 [commitments] [obligations] at their respective penalty rates, as set out above.]

[(d) Compliance action plan

Option 1

The Party in question shall, within [three] months of the determination of the [compliance body] [branch 2], develop and commit itself to a compliance action plan [, taking into account Article 2.3 of the Protocol,] approved by the [compliance body] [branch 2], which shall include, inter alia:

- (i) An analysis of the reasons for the Party's non-compliance;
- (ii) Policies and measures that the Party intends to implement in order to restore [1.x] times the excess emissions and an analysis of their expected impact on the Party's greenhouse gas emissions;
- (iii) A quantified assessment of the use of each of the mechanisms under Articles 6, [12] and [, if provided for by an amendment to the Protocol, Article] 17 during the commitment period;

- (iv) A declaration not to make transfers under Article 3, paragraph 11, for the duration of the implementation of the compliance action plan;
- (v) Detailed information on the economic dimension of the implementation of any action under (ii) or (iii) above;
- (vi) A timetable for implementing the measures within a time-frame not exceeding [three] years, including clear benchmarks for measuring annual progress in the implementation;
- (vii) An assessment of the compatibility of the compliance action plan with the strategy developed by the Party to comply with its obligations during the commitment period in which the compliance action plan is implemented.]

Measures implemented under the compliance action plan shall not contribute to any Party's compliance with its quantified emission limitation or reduction commitments during the commitment period in which the compliance action plan is implemented.

The Party concerned shall submit a progress report on the implementation of the compliance action plan to the [compliance body] [branch 2] annually no later than 15 April. On the basis of the progress report, the [compliance body] [branch 2] shall decide on further recommendations, measures or consequences, as appropriate.]

Option 2

The Party in question shall, [within a time period] after the determination of non-compliance, submit to [the compliance body] [branch 2] a compliance action plan setting forth one or more means by which it intends to restore the tonnes in question.

The means may include, for example, use of one or more mechanisms under Articles 6, [12] and [, if provided for by an amendment to the Protocol, Article] 17, particular measures, and non-allocation of tonnes under a domestic cap-and-trading system [, and use of a voluntary compliance fund].

The Party concerned shall submit a progress report on the implementation of the compliance action plan to the [compliance body] [branch 2] annually no later than [..]. On the basis of the progress report, the [compliance body] [branch 2] shall determine whether the requisite tonnes have been restored.

In the case where [the compliance body] [branch 2] determines [within a specific time-frame,] that some or all of the requisite tonnes have not been restored, it shall deduct the remaining tonnes from the Party's assigned amount for the commitment period following the period for which the non-compliance with Article 3.1 occurred.

Option 1

[(e) Loss of access to the mechanisms under Articles 6, [12] and 17

The Party may not make any transfer or acquisition under Article 3, above a level and for a period of time to be determined by [the compliance body] [branch 2].]

Option 2

[(e) Loss of eligibility to transfer tonnes

Until the Party has demonstrated [to the] [compliance body][branch 2] that it will have a surplus of assigned amount in the subsequent commitment period, its eligibility to transfer assigned amount under Article 17 shall be suspended.]

[(f) Compliance fund

[A compliance fund is hereby established.]

[[Each] [Every] [The] Party [shall] [may] make payments into the compliance fund at a rate that equals [...] per excess tonne of carbon equivalent multiplied by a factor of [1.x][x]].

The compliance fund shall be administered [nationally][or][internationally].

The fund shall disburse its income and any interest it earns to reduce anthropogenic emissions of greenhouse gases. The emissions reductions achieved shall not contribute to any Party's compliance with its quantified emission limitation or reduction commitments.]

[(g) Financial penalty]

[(h) Suspension of rights and privileges]

[(i) Application of Article 4.5 and 4.6

If one or more Parties operating under Article 4 are found not to be in compliance with Articles 5 and 7, each Party to an agreement under Article 4 shall be responsible for its own level of emissions set out in the agreement.

In accordance with Article 4.6 of the Protocol, any non-compliance consequences under this paragraph shall apply to both the regional economic integration organization and any Party that has exceeded its level of emissions as notified in accordance with Article 4.

If one or more Parties operating under Article 4 have been found to have exceeded their respective levels of emissions, the Parties operating under such agreement shall not be able to operate under an Article 4 agreement with respect to the commitment period following

the period for which the non-compliance with Article 3.1 occurred; and Annex B commitments shall apply.

If one or more Parties operating under Article 4 have been found to have exceeded their respective levels of emissions, another Party operating under that Article 4 agreement shall be able to carry over the assigned amount under Article 3.13 only to the extent that the difference between its emissions and its assigned amount under Article 3 is greater than the amount by which the non-complying Parties under Article 4 have exceeded their respective levels of emissions.]

[(j) Compliance reserve]

Section V. Other provisions

Secretariat

The secretariat shall perform the following functions:

- (a) Channel information to the [compliance body];
- (b) Service the meetings of the [compliance body];
- (c) Act as the channel of communication with other Protocol bodies;
- [(d) Refer questions to the [compliance body]]

Relationship with Article 16 of the Protocol

[The multilateral consultative process under Article 16 shall provide advice and facilitate assistance to non-Annex I Parties with respect to issues related to their compliance/non-compliance under the Protocol.]

Relationship with Article 19 of the Protocol

The [compliance body] shall operate without prejudice to Article 19 of the Protocol.

[Evolution] [Modification] [Amendment]

[[Subject to Article 18], the [procedures and mechanisms related to compliance][compliance system] may be modified⁵ by consensus of the Parties to the Protocol, taking into account any amendments to the Protocol, decisions of the COP/MOP and experience gained with the working of the process.]

Adoption of procedures and mechanisms related to compliance⁶

⁵ Depending upon the legal form in which the regime is adopted.

⁶ Formal steps for the adoption of any procedures and mechanisms related to compliance would need to be decided.

[Annex I]

**PROCEDURAL ARRANGEMENTS RELATED TO
[ONLY] [FACILITATION] [BRANCH 1]**

Option 1

1. Cases related to facilitation [set out in the mandate of branch 1 (see section II, paragraph...)] shall be dealt with by [the compliance body] [branch 1] in accordance with the procedures in this annex.
2. Where a Party wishes to request advice or facilitation from [the compliance body] [branch 1] concerning implementation of its own obligations under the Protocol, it may contact [the compliance body] [that branch], indicating the nature of the issue and any relevant circumstances.
3. With respect to questions raised in reports of the expert review teams under Article 8, by a Party regarding another Party's implementation of its commitments under the Protocol, or by the forwarding by [branch 2] of a question to [branch 1] in accordance with paragraph..., the [compliance body] [branch 1] shall notify the Party in question and provide a copy of relevant documentation.
4. The Party may [have the right to] participate in the work of [the compliance body] [branch 1] and provide any information in writing.
5. [The compliance body] [Branch 1] may request information from relevant sources. Non-governmental organizations and others with relevant information may [be invited to] provide information to the [compliance body] [branch]. Information received by [the compliance body] [branch 1] shall be made available to the Party in question.
6. With respect to questions of implementation raised by a Party about implementation of its own [commitments] [obligations], the Party may request that the advice or facilitation be provided in confidence. [The compliance body] [Branch 1] shall honour that request, although the nature of the work performed shall be reported to the COP/MOP in the [compliance body's] annual report.
7. [The compliance body] [Branch 1] may specify outcomes set forth in section IV, paragraph... In such circumstances it shall make public the nature of the implementation issues it reviewed, its conclusions, and the outcomes, if any, it has determined.]

Option 2

The [compliance body] shall review and consider any questions submitted to it concerning a Party's implementation of its [commitments] [obligations] under the Protocol, along with any supporting information and, with a view to securing an amicable solution of the matter on the basis of respect for the provisions of the Protocol, decide whether to apply one or more of the outcomes or consequences set out in section IV, paragraph]

[Annex II]

PROCEDURAL ARRANGEMENTS RELATED TO [ENFORCEMENT][BRANCH 2]

Option 1

1. Cases related to facilitation [set out in the mandate of branch 2 (see section II, paragraph...)] shall be dealt with by [the compliance body] [branch 2] in accordance with the procedures in this annex.
2. After preliminary examination of the questions set out in section III, paragraph... , if [the compliance body] [branch 2] decides that these questions require further proceedings, it shall notify the Party in question through the secretariat and provide a statement of relevant issues.
3. [The compliance body] [branch 2] may request information, including clarification, from relevant sources (such as reports from expert review teams under Article 8). Such information shall be made available to the Party in question and to the public. Other Parties, non-governmental organizations and others with relevant information [shall be given the opportunity] [may be invited] to provide information which [the compliance body] [branch 2] shall make available to the Party in question and to the public. The Party shall be afforded the opportunity to respond in writing to any information considered by the branch.
4. Within [x] weeks from the issuance by [the compliance body] [branch 2] of the notification, the Party in question may provide a written submission in which it presents the facts and its arguments, including any rebuttals of information before the branch.
5. If so requested by the Party in question in its written submission, [the compliance body] [branch 2] shall hold a hearing. At the hearing, [the compliance body] [branch 2] shall ask the Party in question to present its views. The Party in question may present expert testimony at the hearing.
6. [The compliance body] [Branch 2] may at any time put questions to the Party in question and ask it for explanations either in the course of a hearing or in writing.
7. Within [x] weeks from the Party's written submission, or from the date of the hearing if one has been held, or within [x] weeks from the issuance of the notification if the Party has not provided a written response, [the compliance body] [branch 2] shall issue a preliminary finding containing its conclusions and reasons therefor.
8. Any findings of [the compliance body] [branch 2] shall be based on the record before it.

9. Within [x] weeks from the date of the issuance of the preliminary finding, the Party in question may provide a further written submission. Within [x] weeks from receiving this submission, or within [x] weeks from the issuance of the preliminary finding if the Party has not provided a further written submission, [the compliance body] [branch 2] shall issue its final decision.

10. [If [the compliance body] [branch 2] decides that the Party in question is not in compliance with Article 3.1, the Party may appeal in accordance with the procedures set out in section III, paragraph.... [Time limits and other provisions for appeal.]]

11. In the case where [the compliance body] [branch 2] has determined that a Party, following the true-up period, is not in compliance with Article 3.1, it shall apply the outcomes specified in section IV, paragraph....

12. In addition to applying the outcomes set forth in section IV, paragraph..., branch 2 may, at its discretion, decide to forward the case to branch 1 for further consideration.

13. [The compliance body] [branch 2] may prepare rules of procedure that are consistent with the procedures contained herein. Such rules of procedure may be implemented once approved by the COP/MOP and with any modifications made by the COP/MOP.

Option 2

1. Non-compliance with Article 3.1 and the imposition of any outcomes or consequences included in section IV, paragraph... shall be determined in accordance with the enforcement procedure set out in this annex.

2. [Any Party may initiate the enforcement procedure with regard to the compliance of another Party] with its commitments under Article 3.1 of the Protocol, by requesting, through the secretariat, the establishment of an enforcement panel. Any such request must be supported by corroborating information.

3. An enforcement panel shall be established by [the compliance body] at its first meeting following the receipt by the secretariat of a request from a Party, unless [the compliance body] decides by consensus not to establish a panel.

4. Where [the compliance body] concludes that it has sufficient corroborating information to demonstrate the non-compliance of a Party with its commitments under Article 3.1, it may establish an enforcement panel on its own initiative.

[5. When [the compliance body] has established an enforcement panel on its own initiative, the matter shall be taken forward by the chairman of [the compliance body]. When the procedure has been initiated at the request of a Party, the matter shall be taken forward by that Party.]

[6. Each enforcement panel shall be composed of three well-qualified experts, selected by the Executive Secretary of the secretariat from a roster nominated by the COP/MOP.]

7. The panel shall make an assessment of the compliance of the Party concerned with its commitments under Article 3.1 and, if it determines that the Party concerned is in breach of these commitments, shall apply one of the consequences set out in section IV, paragraph... taking into account the cause, type, degree and frequency of such breach.

8. Rules of procedure for the enforcement panel shall be drawn up by the COP/MOP prior to the commencement of the first commitment period.]

[Annex III]

**EXPEDITED PROCEDURE WITH RESPECT
TO QUESTIONS UNDER ARTICLES 6, 12 AND 17**

Option 1

1. The expedited procedure with respect to questions under Articles 6, [12] and [, if provided for by an amendment to the Protocol, Article] 17 shall be dealt with by branch 2.
2. When considering and deciding upon cases related to eligibility requirements for the mechanisms under Articles 6, [12] and [, if provided for by an amendment to the Protocol, Article] 17, [branch 2] shall conduct its proceedings in an expedited manner⁷, while respecting due process. Specific time-frames for such proceedings shall be [decided by the COP/MOP] [as follows...].
3. [Branch 2], in the case where it has determined that a Party does not meet the eligibility requirements for one or more of the mechanisms set forth in or under Articles 6, [12] and [, if provided for by an amendment to the Protocol, Article] 17, shall apply the outcome set out in section IV, paragraph....
- [4. [Branch 2], after determination of non-compliance with the eligibility requirements for one or more of the mechanisms set forth in or under Articles 6, [12] and [, if provided for by an amendment to the Protocol, Article] 17, may decide to forward the case to branch 1 to assist the Party in question in meeting the relevant eligibility requirements.]
- [5. [Branch 2] shall reinstate a Party's eligibility upon its determination, either at the request of the Party in question or at the request of [branch 1] where a case has been forwarded to it by [branch 1], that the Party meets the relevant eligibility requirements.]

Option 2

1. Prior to the start of the first commitment period, the [compliance body] shall, within eight weeks of the date of completion of a review under Article 8, and based on the information submitted by the expert review teams, eligibility criteria established under..., and any other relevant information:
 - (a) Decide that the Party has fulfilled the eligibility criteria set out in ...; or
 - (b) Make a preliminary finding that the Party does not fulfil one or more of the criteria.

It shall forthwith inform the Party of its decision or preliminary finding and make it available to all the other Parties.

⁷ The exercise of the expedited procedure might modify certain provisions with respect to, e.g. certain time-frames, written submissions, hearings, means of communication, appeals contained in option 1 of annex II.

2. During the first commitment period, the [compliance body] shall, based on the information submitted by the expert review teams, review any other relevant information, make decisions on the continuing observance of eligibility criteria established under ... for transfers and acquisitions under the provisions of Article 3.

3. The [compliance body] shall:

(a) Within six weeks of the date on which the submission of the annual greenhouse gas inventory and the annual greenhouse gas inventory report of a Party becomes due, or on which the secretariat registers receipt of such a submission, whichever shall be the earlier, or

(b) Within six weeks of being notified in writing by an expert review team of a problem under paragraph

decide that the Party has fulfilled the eligibility criteria or make a preliminary finding that the Party is in breach of one or more of the criteria. It shall forthwith inform the Party of its decision or preliminary finding and make it available to all the other Parties.

4. If a Party in respect of which a preliminary finding has been made does not submit comments on the finding in writing to the [compliance body] within four weeks of the date on which it was informed of it, the [compliance body] shall forthwith confirm its preliminary finding and impose consequences in accordance with section IV, paragraph

5. If a Party in respect of which a preliminary finding has been made submits comments on the finding in writing to the [compliance body] within four weeks of the date on which it was informed of it, the [compliance body] shall, within four weeks of the date on which it received the comments, consider them and any representations made in due time by any other Party and:

(a) Decide that the Party has fulfilled the eligibility criteria for each of the mechanisms in question; or

(b) Confirm, in whole or in part, its preliminary finding and apply outcomes in accordance with paragraph.....

It shall forthwith inform the Party of its decision or preliminary finding and make it available to all the other Parties.

Option 3

General

1. The [compliance body] [branch of the compliance body] shall consider questions with respect to the mechanisms under Articles 6, [12] and [, if provided for by an amendment to the Protocol, Article] 17, and for this purpose shall elect a chairperson and a vice-chairperson. In addition, it shall determine the order by which a chairperson is to be chosen in the event of both the chairperson and the vice-chairperson not being available.
2. The [COP/MOP] [compliance body] [branch of the compliance body] shall agree upon a list of experts from which substitute members may be drawn when some of the members of the [compliance body] [branch of the compliance body] are not available during the period of time to consider a question related to the mechanisms under Articles 6, [12] and [, if provided for by an amendment to the Protocol, Article] 17. The experts in the list shall be divided into two groups; those from Annex I Parties and those from non-Annex I Parties. For each group, the [COP/MOP] [compliance body] [branch of the compliance body] shall agree upon an order in which experts are drawn when needed.
3. All the communications in the expedited procedure shall be in English. As far as possible they should be in electronic form, or by fax.

Process and schedule

4. The expedited process shall be completed within eight weeks. The approximate time allocated for each step shall be as follows:
 - (a) Screening: one week;
 - (b) Selection of members to consider the question: one week;
 - (c) Initial comments by Parties: one week;
 - (d) E-mail discussion: two weeks;
 - (e) Drafting of the conclusion with reasons by the chairperson: one week;
 - (f) Opportunity to make objections to the [compliance body] [branch of the compliance body] in respect of its conclusion: one week;
 - (g) Preparation for the [meeting] [discussion] [hearing] one week. The [meeting] [discussion] [hearing] shall be scheduled after receipt of comments, if the initial communications had failed to reach a conclusion.

Information to Parties

5. The Party in question shall be informed of every step in the process.
6. The Party shall have every opportunity to provide its views, and/or additional information, during the period of initial comments.

Conclusion

7. The [compliance body] [branch of the compliance body] shall make every effort to reach agreement by consensus. If all efforts at consensus have been exhausted, and no agreement reached, the decision shall, as a last resort, be adopted by a vote [by a double majority of the members of Annex I Parties and the members of non-Annex I Parties].
8. The chairperson shall send decisions, with reasons, to the Parties through the secretariat.

Appeal

9. The Party concerned may appeal the decision of the [compliance body] [branch of the compliance body] in accordance with the procedure set out in section III, paragraph....

Option 4

1. The eligibility panel shall deal, in an expedited manner, with all questions relating to compliance of Annex I Parties with questions specific to mechanisms under Articles 6, [12] and [, if provided for by an amendment to the Protocol, Article] 17. Disputes between the executive board (or other body established for the purposes of the other mechanisms) and a Party relating to the allocation of certified emission reductions (CERs), shall be referred to the eligibility panel.
2. The eligibility panel shall determine appropriate provisional measures to safeguard the functioning of the mechanisms under Articles 6, [12] and [, if provided for by an amendment to the Protocol, Article] 17.
3. The eligibility panel shall determine the most suitable consequence or outcome to deal with a particular case.]

- - - - -