



ENFORCEMENT BRANCH

Ninth meeting

10–12 May 2010
Bonn, Germany

Report on the meeting

1. Opening of the meeting

1. Ms. Sandea J.G.S. De Wet, chairperson of the enforcement branch, declared the meeting open. She thanked the members and alternate members for their support in her election as chairperson and congratulated Mr. René Lefebvre on his election as vice-chairperson.

2. The chairperson recognized and thanked the previous chair of the branch, Mr. Sebastian Oberthür, for his outstanding leadership of the branch from 2008 to 2009. She also thanked the outgoing members and alternate members. She welcomed Mr. José Antonio Gonzalez Norris and Ms. Iryna Rudzko, alternate members who were attending their first meeting of the branch.

3. At the request of the chairperson, the secretariat provided information on participation and quorum, as well as key administrative, logistical and housekeeping arrangements. The secretariat confirmed that there was a quorum for the meeting, that all members and alternate members present had signed the Oath of Service, that the meeting was being webcast live on the Internet, and that an audio recording was being made of the entire meeting. The secretariat noted that no observers had registered for this meeting.

4. The secretariat informed the meeting that Mr. Tinus Pulles, Mr. Marius Taranu and Mr. Newton Paciornik, independent experts invited to the meeting, were in attendance.

5. The secretariat further informed the meeting that one of the designated representatives of Bulgaria, Mr. Hristo Hristov, Executive Director of Bulgaria's Energy Institute, was present at the meeting, together with the following officials of the Government of Bulgaria:

- (a) Ms. Vanya Grigorova, Executive Director of the Executive Environmental Agency;
- (b) Ms. Milya Dimitrova, Director of the Climate Change Policy Directorate of Bulgaria's Ministry of Environment and Water and Bulgaria's National Focal Point for climate change;



COMPLIANCE COMMITTEE**CC/EB/9/2010/2
25 May 2010**

- (c) Ms. Maria Pavlova, Senior Diplomatic Officer in the UN and Global Issues Directorate of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Republic of Bulgaria; and
- (d) Ms. Evelina Nikolova, National Emission Inventory Coordinator and Head of the Air Quality Unit in the Air Monitoring Department of the Executive Environmental Agency.

6. Following brief opening remarks on the proceedings, the chairperson requested the secretariat to provide a summary of the proceedings to date.

2. Adoption of the agenda

7. The branch reviewed and adopted the provisional agenda.

3. Organization of work

8. The branch decided to organize its consideration of the question of implementation with respect to Bulgaria (CC-2010-1/Bulgaria/EB) in the following manner:

- (a) First, to receive expert advice on the report of the review of the annual submission of Bulgaria submitted in 2009 (FCCC/ARR/2009/BGR, hereinafter referred to as the “2009 ARR”);
- (b) Secondly, to hold a hearing of the views of Bulgaria, including any expert testimony it may wish to put forward; and
- (c) Finally, to elaborate and adopt a decision, with further expert advice and questions of Bulgaria as required.

4. Advice from experts

9. Mr. Pulles, one of the lead reviewers of the expert review team that reviewed the annual submission of Bulgaria submitted in 2009 (hereinafter referred to as “the ERT”), made a presentation and provided an overview of the 2009 ARR. In particular, he presented the ERT’s findings in relation to the national system of Bulgaria. Mr. Marius Taranu and Mr. Newton Paciornik provided their views on the findings of the ERT indicated in the 2009 ARR and the questions raised by the enforcement branch in its decision on expert advice dated 15 April 2010 (CC-2010-1-4/Bulgaria/EB). At the request of the branch, the experts also provided their views on the implementation of the work plan submitted by Bulgaria to the ERT on 16 November 2009.



5. Hearing

10. At the hearing, Bulgaria made a presentation and provided its views and background information, based on its written submission (CC-2010-1-5/Bulgaria/EB). Bulgaria presented information relating to its national system, in particular the institutional arrangements, the respective roles and responsibilities of the Ministry of the Environment and Water and the Executive Environmental Agency, the underlying legal framework, arrangements for technical competence of staff involved in the inventory development process, as well as the measures it has taken and plans to take to improve its national system.

11. Bulgaria emphasized that it was committed to improving its national system and had made significant progress in implementing measures to improve the performance of its national system.

6. Elaboration and adoption of a decision

12. After the elaboration of a decision held in private in accordance with rule 9, paragraph 2, of the “Rules of procedure of the Compliance Committee of the Kyoto Protocol”,¹ the branch adopted a preliminary finding (CC-2010-1-6/Bulgaria/EB).

13. The branch was encouraged by the commitment and willingness of Bulgaria to resolve the problems concerning its national system, but noted that significant questions remained regarding the full implementation of measures to ensure the operation of the national system of Bulgaria in accordance with the “Guidelines for national systems for the estimation of anthropogenic greenhouse gas emissions by sources and removals by sinks under Article 5, paragraph 1, of the Kyoto Protocol” (annex to decision 19/CMP.1).

14. The branch applied the relevant consequences provided in section XV of the annex to decision 27/CMP.1, but noted that the findings and consequences take effect upon confirmation by a final decision of the enforcement branch.

15. The branch agreed to meet to adopt a final decision in view of Bulgaria’s stated intention to make a further written submission within four weeks of receipt of the written notification of the preliminary finding. The secretariat informed the branch that arrangements had been made to hold the tenth meeting of the branch from 28 to 29 June 2010 in Bonn, Germany.

7. Other matters

16. The secretariat informed the meeting that the seventh meeting of the plenary, which will consider issues relating to conflict of interest, is scheduled for 30 June 2010 in Bonn, Germany.

¹ Contained in the annex to decision 4/CMP.2, as amended by decision 4/CMP.4.



8. Closure of the meeting

17. After thanking the members and alternate members of the branch for their constructive work and wishing them a safe journey home the chairperson declared the meeting closed.

9. Attendance

18. The names of members and alternate members present at the meeting are bolded below.

Members (in alphabetical order)	Alternate Members
1. DE WET , Sandea J.G.S. Ms.	AMOUGOU, Joseph Armathé Mr.
2. ESTRADA OYUELA , Raúl Mr.	GONZALEZ NORRIS , José Antonio Mr. ⁺
3. FODEKE , Victor Mr.	GOPOLANG, Balisi Justice Mr.
4. LEFEBER , René Mr.	LOIBL, Gerhard Mr.
5. MICHEL , Stephan Mr.	JACOBSEN , Kirsten Ms.
6. OBERTHÜR , Sebastian Mr.*	KUOKKANEN, Tuomas Mr.
7. RAJABOV , Ilhomjon Mr.	NISHAT , Ainun Mr.
8. SHAMANOV , Oleg Mr.	RUDZKO , Iryna Ms.
9. SHAREEF , Mohamed Mr.	MACE , Mary Jane Ms.
10. SU , Wei Mr.	ALAM , Mohammad Mr. ⁺

⁺ Served as member.

* Mr. Oberthür was absent in the afternoon of 11 May 2010 and on 12 May 2010.